

# A Participatory Approach to Urban Planning in Slum Neighbourhoods of the Metropolitan Area of Port-au-Prince

## Summary Report

Anna Calogero, Paola Flores, Benjamin Biscan and Silvere Jarrot



## About the authors

Anna Calogero\*, ESA Consultance; Paola Flores, ESA Consultance; Benjamin Biscan\*, ESA Consultance; Silvere Jarrot, ESA Consultance

\*Contact: [anna.calogero@esa-consultance.com](mailto:anna.calogero@esa-consultance.com) [Benjamin.biscan@esa-consultance.com](mailto:Benjamin.biscan@esa-consultance.com)

Based on full report, in French, available from Anna Calogero: *L'approche participative dans la planification urbaine des quartiers précaires de l'Aire Métropolitaine de Port-au-Prince*

## Urban Crises Learning Fund

This paper is part of a series of research pieces produced under the Urban Crises Learning Fund managed by the Institute for Environment and Development. Funded by the Department for International Development (DFID), the fund aims to build an in-depth understanding of how the humanitarian sector can most effectively operate in urban contexts. This publication was funded with the generous contributions of UK aid from the UK government (DFID). This is an independent report and does not necessarily reflect the views of IIED or DFID. Any errors are on the part of the authors.

## IIED's Human Settlements Group

The Human Settlements Group at the International Institute for Environment and Development (IIED) works to reduce poverty and improve health and housing conditions in the urban centres of Africa, Asia and Latin America. It seeks to combine this with promoting good governance and more ecologically sustainable patterns of urban development and rural-urban linkages.

## Citation

Calogero, A, Flores, P, Biscan, B and Jarrot, S (2017) *A Participatory Approach to Urban Planning in Slum Neighbourhoods of the Metropolitan Area of Port-au-Prince*. Summary Report. Urban Crises Learning Partnership (UCLP).



The Urban Crises Learning Partnership (UCLP) was a two-year (2015–17) learning initiative aimed at improving humanitarian preparedness and response in urban areas. It is a partnership between Habitat for Humanity GB, Oxfam GB, the Overseas Development Institute (ODI), and University College London (UCL). The project has carried out primary research in Haiti and Bangladesh through the National Offices of Habitat for Humanity in both countries, and Oxfam in Bangladesh.

The UCLP has two primary objectives: to improve the way stakeholders in urban crises engage with each other to form new partnerships and make better decisions; and to improve disaster preparedness and response in urban areas by developing, testing, and disseminating new approaches to the formation of these relationships and systems.

The project has addressed these objectives by exploring four related themes: the role of actors who are not part of the formal national or international humanitarian system; accountability to affected populations (AAP); urban systems; and coordinating urban disaster preparedness.

This paper by Anna Calogero, Paola Flores, Benjamin Biscan, and Silvere Jarrot of ESA Consultance in Haiti makes a valuable contribution to the second of these themes – AAP. By analysing the nature and quality of public participation in four urban planning projects following the earthquake of 2010, the paper demonstrates the benefits that may be accrued from participatory approaches, while also providing examples of the challenges associated with public participation. The paper contains valuable lessons for humanitarian and development organisations planning participatory approaches in the recovery phase of urban crises.

Alan Brouder, UCLP Coordinator  
Habitat for Humanity GB  
November 2017

# Contents

<b>Abbreviations and Acronyms</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Summary</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>5</b>
Research Questions	5
<b>Methodology</b>	<b>7</b>
The Literature Review	7
Field Data Gathering	8
Data Analysis of the Field Survey	8
<b>The Concept of Participation in Urban Planning</b>	<b>9</b>
Levels of Citizen Participation	10
From Individual Needs to Collective Projects	11
<b>Involvement of Slum Residents in the Urban Planning of Port-au-Prince</b>	<b>12</b>
Context: The Urban Crisis and the Need for Social Dialogue	13
<b>The Scale</b>	<b>17</b>
<b>The Role of Actors</b>	<b>19</b>
The Haitian Authorities	19
Non-Governmental Organisations	21
Civil Society: The Residents of Slum Neighbourhoods	21
<b>Time</b>	<b>24</b>
Initial Information	26
Urban Diagnostics	27
Urban Planning	29
Participation in Implementation	31
Participation in Maintenance and Management	32
<b>Conclusions</b>	<b>33</b>
Good Participation Practices	33
<b>Project Files</b>	<b>36</b>
<b>Appendices</b>	<b>44</b>
<b>References</b>	<b>45</b>
Selected Bibliography	45
Haitian Operational Directives and National Policies	47

# Abbreviations and Acronyms

AFD	French Development Agency / Agence Française de Développement
ASEC	Communal Section Assemblies / Assemblées des Sections Communales
ATL	Local Technical Agencies / Agence Technique Locale
CASEC	Communal Section Administration Assembly / Conseils d'Administration des Sections Communales
CBO/OCB	Community-Based Organisation / Organisation de Base
CCC	Municipal Dialogue Committee / Comité de Concertation Communale
CHF	Cooperative Housing Foundation (Global Communities)
CIAT	Interministerial Committee for Territorial Management / Comité Interministériel d'Aménagement du Territoire
CNGIS	National Centre for Geo-Spatial Information / Centre National d'Information Géospatiale
DFID	Department for International Development
DINEPA	National Directorate of Drinking Water and Sanitation / Direction Nationale de l'Eau Potable et de l'Assainissement
EDH	Haiti National Electricity Provider / Electricité d'Haiti
EU	European Union
FOKAL	Foundation for Knowledge and Liberty / Fondation connaissance et liberté (Haïti)
GRET	Group for Research and Technology Exchanges / Groupe de Recherches et d'Echanges Technologiques
IDP	Internally Displaced People
IIED	International Institute for Environment and Development
MPCE	Planning and External Cooperation Ministry / Ministère de la Planification et de la Coopération Externe
MTPTC	Public Works, Transportation and Communication Ministry / Ministère des Travaux Publics, Transports et Communications
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organisations
OIM	International Organisation for Migration / Organisation Internationale pour les Migrations
UN-HABITAT	United Nations Human Settlements Programme
PARAQ	Programme of Support to Reconstruction and to Neighbourhood Rehabilitation / Programme d'Appui à la Reconstruction et à l'Aménagement de Quartiers
PCD	Municipal Development Plan / Plan Communal de Développement
PCMB	Programme for Neighbourhood Upgrade / Programa Comunitario de Mejoramiento Barrial
PRODEPUR	Participatory Project for Development in Urban Settings / Projet de Développement Participatif en Milieu Urbain
SI	Solidarités International
SODADE	Society for Planning and Development / Société d'aménagement et de développement
SPU	Urban Planning Service / Service de Planification Urbaine
UCLBP	Housing and Public Buildings Construction Unit / Unité de Construction de Logements et des Bâtiments Publics
UNDP	UN Development Programme
UNOPS	UN Office for Project Services
ZAC	Urban Development Zone / Zone d'aménagement concerté

# Summary

This study was undertaken as part of the Urban Crises Learning Partnership (UCLP),<sup>1</sup> aiming to improve the knowledge around disaster preparedness and urban crisis response – a topic which is of concern due to the increasing ‘urbanisation of risk’ and to the scarce amount of consolidated response practices in this field (IRC, 2017). The research focuses on experiences and outcomes from participatory urban planning in Haiti in order to identify opportunities to improve response patterns and urban governance.

The first chapter sets out a description of the study’s methodology and its selection criteria for case studies. A summary sheet for each case study and selected neighbourhood is available as an appendix to the document. The second chapter introduces the universal notion of participation as applied to the

sustainable and inclusive development of modern urban environments, for disadvantaged populations and otherwise. It illustrates the levels of involvement identified in international initiatives: information, consultation, dialogue, and participation. The third chapter analyses case studies selected from participatory planning exercises carried out in the Port-au-Prince metropolitan area between 2012 and 2016. This analysis is based on the model developed by Boris Graizbord,<sup>2</sup> and considers four key factors: context, scale, role of actors, and time. The final chapter identifies best practices for participatory urban planning, and innovative opportunities to improve urban governance through the methodologies used in the case studies.

---

<sup>1</sup> The partnership is managed by the International Institute for Environment and Development (IIED) and funded by the UK Department for International Development (DfID). Habitat for Humanity International is an agent of the partnership in Haiti.

<sup>2</sup> Graizbord is Professor-Researcher at the Center for Demographic, Urban, and Environmental Studies and is the LEAD-Mexico Coordinator (graizbord@lead.colmex.mx). He is author of Graizbord, B. (1999). *Planeación urbana, participación ciudadana y cambio social*, Economía, Sociedad y Territorio, El Colegio Mexiquense, A.C., Toluca, México.

# Introduction

Citizen participation, and the involvement of civil society in projects funded by international aid organisations, have been heavily researched since the early 2000s. The present analysis aims to provide insight into the role of participation by civil society in planning and urban rehabilitation in slum neighbourhoods of Port-au-Prince after the earthquake of 2010. In order to analyse such processes and their impacts, the study focused on the post-disaster period of 2012 to 2016.

Beyond the need for immediate humanitarian response measures, the 2010 earthquake also highlighted an urgent need for planning tools to allow the government to guide international aid towards sustainable rebuilding of the Haitian capital. In addition to this, actors had to cope with an inconsistent reconstruction framework and lack of planning guidance due to weaknesses in institutions. In such contexts, civil society can play a fundamental role in integrating critical knowledge of a neighbourhood into a future vision for its development. Therefore, when humanitarian response programmes of the immediate aftermath were gradually replaced by post-emergency projects in 2012, several included participation from the local population. This contributed to the development of knowledge about slum neighbourhoods as a means of identifying future programmatic actions and defining the urban development axes of the area. Participatory approaches to decision-making on urban development are increasingly common; however, this method remains underdeveloped in Haiti due to a widespread perception that residents stand in the way of action for the public good.

## Research Questions

The following research questions were selected for the study:

1. What types of participatory urban planning approaches were encountered in the context of post-earthquake urban rehabilitation projects in the slum neighbourhoods of Port-au-Prince?
2. What impact did these experiences of participatory urban planning have on the lives of people in slum neighbourhoods?
3. What insights can be gained from initiatives to improve governance in the slum neighbourhoods of the Port-au-Prince metropolitan area?

According to UN-Habitat's definition (UN-Habitat, 2008), 'residents of slum neighbourhoods' refers to a group of people who live in an area lacking one or more of the following:

1. Sustainable and permanent housing to provide shelter against extreme weather events and serious natural disasters.
2. Shelter with enough space to host a maximum of three people in the same room.
3. Access to safe and affordable drinking water.
4. Availability of adequate sanitation systems to serve a reasonable number of people.
5. Guaranteed land tenure.

Most households in the slum neighbourhoods of Port-au-Prince meet all the specific criteria of UN-Habitat's definition. However, there are significant differences in the level of vulnerability of households in the same slum neighbourhood. Key indicators include: building type (ranging from construction in concrete blocks to unfinished shelters with one or more floors); status of building owners (owner of the building and the land, farmer of the land, or renter of one or two rooms in a complex building); and location of the building within the neighbourhood (pedestrian accessibility, proximity to a motorway, and access to basic services<sup>3</sup>).

The residents of these areas comprise approximately 80 per cent of the capital's population (Goulet, 2014). Their vulnerability is the result of a very complex combination of anthropogenic and socio-economic factors, as well as the natural hazards threatening Haiti and risks associated with the geography of the areas in which informal settlements generally develop.

Women represent one of the most vulnerable groups within slum neighbourhoods. Their socio-economic status remains disproportionately low due to domestic violence and gender disparity in educational enrolment – 28 per cent of women and 19 per cent of men in Haiti cannot read or write (IHSI, *et al.*, 2014). This limits women's access to the formal labour market. According to several studies, women generally serve two functions in Haitian society: reproduction and management of the family unit, and engagement in economic activity that contributes significantly towards the household's purchasing power (IHSI *et al.*, 2014). At the national level, women head 44 per cent of all households, and nearly 80 per cent of single-parent households (IHSI *et al.*, 2014). One aim of this study is to determine women's participation levels in activities related to urban planning and rehabilitation.

---

<sup>3</sup> It should be noted that households that moved after the earthquake had a tendency to relocate to the highest and most poorly served areas of Morne l'Hôpital, or outside the metropolitan area of Port-au-Prince in Canaan sites.

# Methodology

A literature review and collection of field data on citizen participation were conducted over a four-month period.

## The Literature Review

Reports addressing civil society participation in urban planning tend to vary in their definition of actors and objectives. For the purposes of this research, it is therefore necessary to clarify these concepts with regard to urban issues and reconstruction.

In addition to analysis, the literature review aims to identify relevant global experiences, and put forward specific cases that illustrate opportunities for participatory processes within urban development efforts. Particular attention has been paid to the main participatory urban planning projects implemented in response to the 2010 earthquake by the Haitian government, international organisations, and civil society.

Based on data collected as part of this process, the study went on to review Haitian case studies and deepen its investigations through field data collection. Haitian case studies were chosen according to the following criteria:

- The project includes participatory urban analysis and urban planning. This was developed by different experts in order to compare, and represent in the best way possible, the different participatory approaches implemented in the projects.
- The project is implemented in neighbourhoods located in different zones of the Port-au-Prince metropolitan area.
- The project seeks participation from local authorities in its planning process.
- The project specifically takes gender into account in its participatory processes.

Nevertheless, the choice of projects that could serve as case studies was restricted by the following:

- Inability to obtain project documents, including detailed information regarding participants in the urban planning process, and difficulty in meeting with project teams and/or collaborators from the targeted area.
- Neighbourhood safety conditions where there was no guarantee that the field investigation phase could be completed.

Four cases were finally chosen to strengthen this research:<sup>4</sup>

- **Case Study 1:** Participatory urban planning in the districts of Morne Lazarre and Nérette, implemented in 2012 in the context of the Débris 2 project, and then within the framework of the neighbourhood rehabilitation project titled 16/6,<sup>5</sup> led by the Haitian government.
- **Case Study 2:** Participatory urban planning in Haut-Turgeau and Debussy, implemented in 2015 in the context of the urban rehabilitation project Menm Katye, Lèt Vizaj, as part of the Neighbourhood Reconstruction and Development Support programme (PARAQ – Programme d’appui à la reconstruction et à l’aménagement de quartiers).
- **Case Study 3:** Participatory urban planning in Carrefour which ended in 2014, in the context of the urban rehabilitation project Katye nou pi bèl, as part of the PARAQ programme.
- **Case Study 4:** Participatory urban planning in Christ-Roi, as part of the urban rehabilitation project titled Pwoje pour remanbre Kriswa, which was executed in 2013 under the PARAQ programme.

<sup>4</sup>The four cases are annexed in the summary sheets, which specify the projects’ partners, financing, and other details.

<sup>5</sup>For more information, see: <http://www.projet16-6.org/>.

## Field Data Gathering

Field data collection was then carried out in order to better understand the methodology and implementation process of citizen participation, as well as its impacts, whether positive or negative. Discussion workshops, semi-structured interviews, and open-ended interviews were conducted with the main actors in the participatory processes of the four case studies.<sup>6</sup> Eight discussion workshops were held between May 16 and May 27, 2017,<sup>7</sup> in order to understand how the experiences and collective views of individuals affected planning processes. The open-ended and semi-structured interviews aimed to provide strategic information on case studies, and to detail planning processes involving local community-based organisations (CBOs), specialists, local authorities, and some donors.

## Data Analysis of the Field Survey

The discussion workshops were recorded and transcribed to facilitate qualitative analysis of their content. Beyond the methodologies and objectives of the projects, the analysis of field survey data is meant to determine the impacts of participation on planning initiatives. By analysing what participants from civil society learned from the planning process, actors can better understand the extent to which participatory processes can contribute towards building resilient communities that are able to understand the dynamics of their area, reflect on problems that affect them, solicit input from relevant actors, and undertake sustainable initiatives for the improvement of their circumstances.

## Challenges of Data Collection

The following challenges and limitations were encountered in the process of collecting data about the case studies:

- The urban planning documentation was available on request from the implementing agency involved. Although most of these were made public – printed and distributed to civil society representatives and the metropolitan authorities during project implementation – the files, including all planning documents produced after the earthquake, have not been publicly archived.

- Urban planning documentation incorporates succinct information on the participatory methodology used by the contractor involved, and on the educational impact of the participatory processes. Therefore, individual interviews were required to collect the data needed for this research. The lack of shared public documents prevents pooling of experiences and replication of effective and consolidated participatory processes. Therefore, the wealth of technical ‘on the ground’ knowledge accumulated by a contractor is only used while their organisation’s activities are in operation.

The ESA Consultants team ran workshops with assistance from mobilisers who implemented contractors’ planning activities. Mobilisers used participant lists, provided in the annexes of planning documents, to contact people involved in the planning process five years prior, and invited 10–15 people to each workshop (attendance numbers largely depended on availability). This data collection phase could not have been accomplished as quickly as it was without door-to-door visits to solicit participation in the workshops.

- The condition of some neighbourhoods meant that many residents who participated in earlier planning activities had since changed their home addresses. For instance, there was significant migration of people from Carrefour to Chile. Delmas 32<sup>8</sup> and Christ Roi are very dense neighbourhoods that continuously evolve, and in which there is reportedly “no sense of community”.<sup>9</sup> The constant renewal of community members was a limiting factor for the research, but also raises questions about the criteria for representativeness that should be adopted in a participatory planning process.
- In the planning workshops, participants were asked to share their recollection of the participatory planning activities as well as other training undertaken as part of the same project. ESA facilitators found it difficult to channel participants’ thoughts into the urban planning activities due to the frustration they expressed about the actual achievements by the project. Because of the tensions that often develop during the implementation phase of a project, participants did not always clearly distinguish between learning and aversion to participatory planning activities.<sup>10</sup>

---

<sup>6</sup>The full list of interview participants and associated discussions are available in the Appendix.

<sup>7</sup>Two workshops were held per case study – one with male and female participants, and the other exclusively with female participants.

<sup>8</sup>The field survey included semi-directed interviews with platform representatives and Delmas 32 CBOs that had participated in planning activities organised in 2010 by the Haitian urban planning firm SODADE and the Municipality of Delmas. According to the testimonies, following the completion of road repair work in the neighbourhood, the price of rents increased five-fold, causing the displacement of a significant number of families.

<sup>9</sup>Intervention during the Women’s Discussion Workshop for Case Study 4 (Christ-Roi), May 2017.

<sup>10</sup>It was interesting – particularly in light of expectations created during planning activities – to understand the extent to which participatory processes, instead of ‘bringing together’, instead risk ‘splitting’ by fuelling tensions between communities and local authorities or organisations.

# The Concept of Participation in Urban Planning

Citizen participation is a concept that has evolved over time, its definition taking various forms depending on the actors it involves and processes through which it operates. In 1972, James V. Cunningham (Cunningham, 1972) defined participation as “a process in which the ordinary people of a community exercise power on resolving issues linked to generalities of their communities”. Donna Hardina (Hardina, 2008) supports the idea that participation should be a means of expression for the most marginalised people – a process that involves them in the management and production of the services they receive. However, since 1990, citizen participation is no longer viewed simply as a means to integrate the ‘excluded’ into the democratic system, but as a way to improve its function. In development, participation can be seen as “the will to reach a process of social transformation from the ecological and economic point of view; the manner to realise it must be adapted to the local context” (Leguenic, 2001).

Although citizen participation appears to have taken a central position in the process of managing a city, various difficulties and bureaucratic practicalities often prevent it from being effective.<sup>11</sup> André Thibault (1996) stated that “the practice of participation is more used for its democratic symbolic value than for its effective contribution to the decision-making process” (Langlois, 2006). In 2012, the National League of Cities (Conseil National des Villes) in France went further by establishing “that a good number of approaches that are named ‘consultations’ or even ‘dialogues’ are, in reality, forms of communication developed around the policies that are already established” (National League of Cities, 2011).

On the contrary, for citizens to be at the heart of a decision-making process, their position must change from that of a ‘receiver’ to that of ‘actor’ – and

they must own the process of making this change. Among the necessary tools for this are training and decision-making support mechanisms (García, 2010). This support must ensure decision-making power independently of pressure groups. Citizen participation requires that all parties have equal knowledge, to be achieved through a process of empowering the local population to evolve its role, establish meaningful involvement, and become accountable to the community. The participatory approach can thus be seen as a way of transforming a population into a proactive group presiding over, and evolving with, the projects that affect it.

The Brussels Institute for Management of the Environment has produced a guide on citizen participation in urban development projects, which stressed that “it is appropriate to clarify, at each stage of the process of participation, what is expected of the participants because if the objectives of the participation are not well specified, disappointments, conflicts, blockages and misunderstandings can arise” (Brussels Institute for the management of the Environment, 2013). This implies a change in approach from one based on needs to one based on rights and duties, in order to clarify the roles and responsibilities of each actor. Morales emphasises the importance of defining the means, mechanisms, and objectives of participation in order to accurately define expectations and scope of influence over decisions (Morales, 2007). The participatory approach requires a wide-ranging investigation into the population’s role in an urban project, but more generally in the city. For Claudia López (López, 2010), “in everyday life, where actors are faced with problems and needs, the participatory development opens up spaces that facilitate interaction that enables actors to co-create the solution”.

---

<sup>11</sup> In 2007, during the French presidential campaign, Socialist Party candidate Segolene Royal made citizen participation a campaign argument as well as the symbol of the political renewal the party wished to embody. The concept, however, had never been the subject of clear proposals.

## Levels of Citizen Participation

While the concept of citizen participation can be understood in different ways, in most democratic countries it is possible to identify, compare, and prioritise levels of participation. This study identifies and defines four levels of participation: information, consultation, dialogue, and involvement.

### Information

Information is the first step of the process, and is often associated with other mechanisms of participation. It offers participatory involvement by providing people with information and updates on a project that is either pending or in progress. Giving citizens the opportunity to act through the provision of clear, understandable, and objective information means they become capable of influencing the management of their communities. In this framework, information moves from top to bottom levels of governance, and different methods can be used or combined to involve a variety of actors.

Since 2000, the French SRU law<sup>12</sup> has required political authorities to integrate citizen participation within the framework of implementing local urban development plans. As specific guidelines for this consultation are not always defined, local authorities have often limited themselves to simply providing information about a project to ensure its legitimacy and facilitate its acceptance. Citizens are invited to receive information – often presented in the form of models and/or panels – and discuss it publicly without having received specific training or support. The discussions that follow generally result in the expression of discontent rather than in the improvement of projects.

### Consultation

The process of consultation allows citizens to express opinions, expectations, and needs with regard to a project. There is an abundance of such consultative processes, particularly in Latin America, where they have been widely practised over the past two decades. Analysis of an experiment, conducted in the context of Argentina's Santa Fe city strategic development plan since 2008, allows us to observe a strong representative consultative process. Its citizen assembly provides

people the opportunity to voice opinions on projects and ensure they remain fair and equitable. In view of its success, local authorities have kept the mechanism active beyond the timeframe originally planned, and have used it to initiate political, territorial, and institutional transformation. The citizen assembly has become an instrument to guide public input and a political orientation mechanism that operates through dialogue (see next section). Due to a deep-seated predisposition to participatory processes and a desire to improve existing practices, citizen assemblies are strongly developed throughout Latin America.

### Dialogue

Dialogue allows an exchange of knowledge and skills among various actors, aiming to create a collaborative definition of the project. The opinion of citizens remains consultative in this process, but its integration at the inception of a project allows them to weigh in on important decision-making processes. The establishment of a dialogue process may create a mechanism for continuous exchange, which often extends through to the management and/or monitoring of projects.

In order to establish a more precise understanding of such a process it is useful to consider the case of the Sebkhia commune in Mauritania, which has developed an ambitious municipal framework for dialogue. Its strategy calls for the creation of a municipal dialogue committee (Comité de Concertation Communale – CCC) that provides a forum for members of local civil society, local elected representatives, people in leadership positions within the community, and representatives of the state to exchange ideas about any municipal development activity or planning of future projects that affect residents in any way. As it lacks decision-making power, the CCC supports the municipal council in its consideration and prioritising of decisions. The committee is both a support tool for local management and a space to strengthen social links between different actors. As its existence is not directly linked to the implementation of a specific project, this dialogue strategy allows citizens to assist, advise, and guide public action over the long term.

---

<sup>12</sup>The Law of Solidarity and Urban Renewal

## Involvement

Involvement is the most robust level of participation: the actors involved are not only integrated into the processes of decision-making and defining a project's actions, but also are included in its implementation. This level of participation requires a greater transfer of skills, resources, and responsibilities from the authorities to the population.

A programme developed in the 1990s in Latin America by the Inter-American Development Bank (IADB), the Community Programme for Neighbourhood Improvement (Programa Comunitario de Mejoramiento Barrial – PCMB), provides useful examples of projects seeking involvement from marginalised populations (Bazzaco and Sepúlveda, 2010). The PCMB provided civil society with funds and encouraged it to define, propose, and execute urban projects based on technical criteria. Its objectives were to promote active community participation in all stages of the project, as well as offer training workshops in construction and project management. The PCMB not only impacted the structuring and effectiveness of community organisations, it also allowed for the emergence of new approaches to participation, and promoted more democratic management of needs assessments. However, the programme developed too rapidly to allow for solid training, support, and evaluation of actors and their projects; this led to an overlap between similar projects and repetition of errors (Ziccardi, 2013).

## From Individual Needs to Collective Projects

The complexity of urban environments, and the growing interdependence between residents, both demand that city development processes involve the populations living in them. People who live in cities are often a part of inequitable social systems – not everyone has the same amount of free time, the same access to culture, or the same information and social networks to enable successful participation. Effective citizen participation requires from governing institutions more than listening capacity and adaptability; it needs spaces for an exchange of views, and cultural and material instruments in order to function. This democratic intent gives rise to a variety of collective tools to support the process, and “this can be named participation” (López, 2010). Such instruments must allow each citizen to articulate their particular vision and experience of the city. This is a form of empirical knowledge that enables institutions to capture the subtleties and complexity of the urban fabric. It is the collective project itself – a result of individual expression – that allows citizens to shift their status from beneficiaries to actors (Flores and Jarrot, 2016).

Rosales-Montano S. (2009) adds that training must be seen as an integral part of citizen participation mechanisms in order to build a common language. The educational process must allow for the emergence of political and social skills, as well as technical capacities, to produce information that is understandable and accessible to the entire population.

# Involvement of Slum Residents in the Urban Planning of Port-au-Prince

Between 2010 and 2016, many reconstruction projects integrated an urban diagnostic and forward-looking urban vision in order to understand the opportunities that the 2010 earthquake created to restore communities. In order to allow displaced populations to return to a safer neighbourhood, the projects were developed around the following points:

- Rebuild and strengthen neighbourhood housing buildings.<sup>13</sup>
- Build risk mitigation infrastructures and improve access to basic services.

The literature review identified 34 projects that used participatory processes for planning and implementation, executed between 2010 and 2016<sup>14</sup> within the informal neighbourhoods of Port-au-Prince's metropolitan area.<sup>15</sup>

The process of urban diagnostic in the neighbourhoods was carried out by various actors – from non-governmental organisations (NGOs) to international consulting firms – and this led to a variety of practices and results. Combined action by donors (the European Union (EU), French Development Agency (AFD – Agence Française de Développement), and the World Bank, for example) and of the Haitian authorities, has harmonised the action of these implementing agencies. The Methodological Guide for the Rehabilitation of Neighbourhoods (CIAT *et al.*, 2013) a document produced by CIAT, the Housing and Public Building Construction Unit (UCLBP) and the Ministry of Public Works, Transport and Communication (Ministère des Travaux Publics, Transports et Communications – MTPTC), required all actors working in urban areas

to produce 'urban diagnostics' allowing to guide the suggested urban development and identify priorities. Named 'neighbourhood development plans', the urban planning documents issued by the different implementing agencies have similarities in structure and content but differ in their methodologies – this makes for an interesting comparison of the position and function they give to citizen involvement.

The projects implemented in the metropolitan area have targeted the following locations:

- The majority of slum neighbourhoods located at the south of Port-au-Prince, on the hills of the Morne l'Hôpital, from the east of the Juvénat district to the west of Carrefour neighbourhood.
- The informal settlements of Pétiion-Ville, Delmas, and Port-au-Prince located between Delmas Street and Avenue John Brown / Pan American Avenue.

In order to determine the nature of residents' involvement in the reconstruction and in the urban planning of slum neighbourhoods, this study adopted the model suggested by Boris Graizbord (Graizbord, 1999). This model is constructed around four dimensions that allow a broad overview of citizen involvement using qualitative analysis. According to Graizbord (1999), the context, scale, role of stakeholders, and timeframe constitute the main dimensions of understanding the characteristics of the participatory process:

- **Context:** A dimension that illustrates the circumstances in which the participatory planning process is developing. In this study, the context is the post-disaster response.

---

<sup>13</sup>The 'housing' components of the reconstruction projects planned for new construction of individual houses, or of housing blocks, and repair or reinforcement of existing buildings. Most of these projects were carried out with on-the-job training, or with a homeowner-driven construction process; and, to a lesser extent, with local construction companies selected through public tenders.

<sup>14</sup>The list of projects carried out is available in the Appendix.

<sup>15</sup>The recent participatory planning experience led by UN-Habitat targeting the Canaan area is not included in the projects listed.

- **Scale:** A dimension that allows definition of the scope of an intervention, and its characteristics.
- **Role of stakeholders:** A dimension that defines the nature, identity, and objectives or interests of each actor involved in the participatory process, as well as the relationships between them.
- **Time:** A dimension that allows to analyse and understand the weight of citizen involvement in urban projects by observing at which step(s) of the project's process that involvement took place.

As they all arise from the post-disaster response, the dimensions of context, scale, and time are very similar between the projects identified within this research study. The report first presents essential aspects of the roles of authorities and NGOs, and then focuses on the role of civil society. Due to the difficulty of undertaking a deeper analysis of all 34 'participatory' urban planning projects, four projects were selected:

- **Case Study 1 – Morne Lizarre and Nérette:** A government-led project (facilitated by UCLBP) that created a community platform to interact with the neighbourhood during the problem-identification, planning, and execution stages.
- **Case Study 2 – Haut-Turgeau and Debussy:** A project implemented by an NGO (GOAL), in a neighbourhood with an existing community platform that has been integrated into process planning without necessarily being at its heart.
- **Case Study 3 – Carrefour (Ti-Sous neighbourhood, Grenada, and Sapotille Aztek):** A project implemented by an NGO (CARE), which organised a planning process open to the public, as well as a community platform during the implementation phase.
- **Case Study 4 – Christ-Roi:** A project implemented by an NGO (SI), which did not create a community platform to interact with the neighbourhood during planning and implementation. The project interacted with the community by establishing a series of communication activities and tools.

These four case studies cover different neighbourhoods in different zones of the Port-au-Prince metropolitan area targeted by post-earthquake urban projects.

## Context: The Urban Crisis and the Need for Social Dialogue

In order to understand the context in which the projects have been developed, we focus on two particular aspects of the metropolitan area of Port-au-Prince: the informal nature of urban development and the local specificities this produced; and, the local consequences and humanitarian needs resulting from the earthquake of January 12, 2010.

### Uncontrolled Development of Slum Neighbourhoods

Since the 1980s<sup>16</sup> and the fall of Jean-Claude Duvalier's authoritarian regime, controlled urban development gave way to unconstrained construction under the influence of 'land grab' measures and the resale of public land. This informal growth led to the urbanisation of peripheral rural areas and settlement of high-risk areas (e.g. ravines, mountainsides). Many of the neighbourhoods that emerged at that time, partly under the influence of the middle class, are what we now call slum neighbourhoods.

The four neighbourhoods considered in this research emerged during the same period after the 1980s:

- Morne Lizarre and Nérette (Case Study 1) developed as a grain-growing area. In the case of Lizarre Morne, a land dispute between two families pushed one owner to construct buildings after the 1970s in order to assert ownership through landholding.
- Turgeau and Debussy (Case Study 2) is a territory with a heterogeneous urban fabric, which experienced a surge of urbanisation after the earthquake, specifically in its peripheral areas and especially on the hills of Morne Hospital.
- Carrefour (Ti-Source districts, Grenada, and Sapotille Aztek – Case Study 3) was a small peripheral town founded in 1813, which gradually became the second most populous municipality in the metropolitan area of Port-au-Prince (IHSI, 2015) by expanding westwards.
- Christ-Roi (Case Study 4) is a neighbourhood in the centre of the city, which developed around Ravine Nicolas, historically the hunting ground of a wealthy landowner.<sup>17</sup>

<sup>16</sup> In the four case studies, the period of densification, which led to that are considered precarious neighbourhoods, occurred between 1980 and 1990.

<sup>17</sup> Information extracted from the urban diagnostics.

The informal development process of urban land has shaped a strong, dense urban fabric in the metropolis, where neighbourhoods that developed without state control are estimated to host 80 per cent of the population (Goulet, 2004).

The abandonment of these areas, due to a lack of interest or ability by the government to improve living conditions, has created a situation where residents of the many informal neighbourhoods had to “organise in parallel to the regular system to overcome the carelessness of public services and the authorities” (Couet, 2013). This was echoed in 2015 by urban planner Garry Lhérisson, who defined ‘the Haitian town’ as a “subject forgotten by the legislator”,<sup>18</sup> referring to the absence of a clear institutional framework for urban development in Haiti.

Confronted with the absence of authorities that are considered legitimate, and politically and socially able to intervene, it was essential for implementing agencies running rebuilding efforts to develop their strategies of dialogue with residents. This social exchange was needed to address institutions’ knowledge gaps about slum neighbourhoods,<sup>19</sup> and to legitimise activities that were often led by international non-governmental organisations (INGOs). Indirectly, the participatory approach was also set up to ease communication and collaboration between the municipal actors and residents of the slum neighbourhood. M. Rodrigue Fils Sully Guerrier,<sup>20</sup> who worked in the municipality of Port-au-Prince, recognised the value of the participatory approach in planning process in the way it enables residents and institutions to find a middle ground.

In addition, the absence of a clear legal framework for ensuring and defending the rights and duties of each party meant that slum neighbourhood residents needed to address their own needs independently. This autonomy limited the possibilities for creating a collective identity linked to each location, which in turn had a significant impact on the definition and implementation of interventions after the earthquake.

In order to introduce a dialogue with the slum neighbourhood residents, it was necessary to identify actors who were considered legitimate, and were able to go beyond their individual interests to work for the collective interest or, if necessary, set up systems in which leaders were not involved. This difficulty has been addressed by operators through two strategies:

- The establishment of a community platform representing residents (Morne Lazarre and Nérette; Ti-Source, Grenada, and Aztek Sapotille<sup>21</sup>; and Haut-Turgeau<sup>22</sup>).
- The establishment of a system of communication, exchange, and production and collection of data (Haut-Turgeau, Debussy Christ-Roi; Ti-Source, Grenada, and Sapotille Aztek).

### Earthquake Response: An Opportunity for Development

The earthquake that struck Port-au-Prince presented one of the most significant humanitarian crises of the past 30 years, and triggered a major influx of humanitarian aid.<sup>23</sup> Strongly influenced by the concept of local action, many interventions sought to empower beneficiaries to become actors themselves, and reconstruction agencies have since tried to increase this type of involvement. Initially, this resulted in activities including clearing, demolition, housing survey, and construction of temporary shelters. In 2011, the need to produce an urban study, and a new trend towards genuine development projects, were reflected in UN Habitat programming.<sup>24</sup> The ambition of these projects – which were named ‘retour-quartier’ (literally, ‘back to the neighbourhood’) and sought to improve living conditions in displaced populations’ neighbourhoods of origin in order to facilitate their return – has exposed the limits of traditional approaches to humanitarian action.

In 2013, the Groupe URD (Emergency Rehabilitation Development Group) confirmed the importance

---

<sup>18</sup> Article 9 of the 1987 Constitution divides the national territory into departments, districts, communes, districts, and communal sections. “Nowhere has the notion of city or urban space been defined”, writes Lhérisson, G. (2015).

<sup>19</sup> It is important to note that the National Directorate of Drinking Water and Sanitation (Direction Nationale de l’Eau Potable et de l’Assainissement – DINEPA) is one of the most engaged actors working in informal communities, and has been developing activities to facilitate access to water for a long time.

<sup>20</sup> Interview with Rodrigue Fils Sully Guerrier, Director of Development and Land Management, Port-au-Prince Town Hall, May 2017.

<sup>21</sup> The community platform in Case Study 3 was formed during the implementation phase of the development projects.

<sup>22</sup> It should be noted that in the Haut-Turgeau district after the earthquake, the population was engaged twice in a participatory process: in the Débris 2 project (in 2012), UN-Habitat mandated GOAL to work with the community platform area for the development of a neighbourhood profile. And again in 2013, GOAL, which led the PARAQ project for redeveloping the neighbourhoods of Haut-Turgeau and Debussy, developed participatory consultations in order to define the urban development strategy and priority projects for the area.

<sup>23</sup> In 2012, the UN-Habitat programme manager in Haiti estimated that approximately US\$1 billion had been spent or allocated to interventions between 2010 and 2012.

<sup>24</sup> Within the framework of the Débris 2 Programme and the Support Programme for the Reconstruction of Housing and Neighbourhoods (Programme d’Appui à la Reconstruction du Logement et des Quartiers), UN Habitat intervened to support selected organisations in developing urban analyses.

of working with a participatory approach after the earthquake: “In the context of an increasing awareness of the multiple constraints in affected urban contexts, and of the discovery of a lack of availability of basic information for the necessary coordination and prioritisation in order to bring aid” (Groupe URD, 2013), citizen involvement has become indispensable. The Group also highlights the inability of the Cluster approach to facilitate the design and implementation of humanitarian response, due to a lack of tools and mechanisms able to increase participation in affected communities (Groupe URD, 2012).

This indispensable involvement of residents benefitted from concepts, approaches, and methodologies picked up from the urban management and urban planning fields. UN-Habitat also mentions that “the tools and the reports issued of the various planning activities, supervised by a team of urbanists and architects, represented a source of knowledge about the neighbourhoods, the social logic of their development, and the potential and limitations of the physical site” (UN-Habitat, 2012).

Reconstruction organisations participated in the urban planning, development, and rehabilitation of neighbourhoods by incorporating the following practices:

- Urban diagnostic and urban development planning on a neighbourhood scale, driving the strategic actions necessary to reduce risk and decrease inequality in urban slums.
- The multidimensional nature of area-based projects, which integrate ‘hard’ components such as the construction of equipment and infrastructure, and ‘soft’ components such as capacity-building for local actors.
- The involvement of residents in the projects as active actors who are able to produce information (diagnostic/problem identification), and to participate in decision-making (planning) and execution (implementation) in cooperation with local authorities, and national and international organisations.

Some of these ‘new’ practices, including the use of the neighbourhood as the scale for intervention, have been criticised due to legal concerns.<sup>25</sup> The positions assigned to residents in some projects were also criticised: appointing locals as experts and/or decision makers can undermine the Haitian public institutions

legally responsible for land management and urban development. For Jarrot and Flores (2016), “the ambition to improve the involvement of ‘beneficiaries’ in humanitarian projects has replaced the desire to initiate new practices by which public institutions could improve their practices on a sustainable basis”. Yet, the participation of local inhabitants in all projects related to their living environment appears to be a successful outcome of the projects that were carried out.

### Investigations into the importance of participatory planning

In 2016, as part of a lessons learned exercise, initiated by the World Bank on the response to the 2010 earthquake, it was pointed out that the Haitian government and external agencies had agreed on the necessity to use the recovery process in order to move towards sustainable development goals – despite disagreement on the cost of delaying recovery time and urban planning commitments (Global Facility for Disaster Reduction and Recovery, 2016). Donors, supported by national authorities, released funds between 2010–2012 in order to respond to the humanitarian, social, and political issues that needed urgent action after the earthquake. At the same time, smaller amounts of funding were allocated for the production of urban diagnostics that could then channel future investments.<sup>26</sup> While this choice clearly demonstrates an awareness of the need to rebuild better after the earthquake, the simultaneous attempt to implement humanitarian response measures and development planning efforts did not allow for optimal planning. While the response during the crisis phase (2010–2011) and post-crisis phase (2012–2013) allocated very high sums to reconstruction, the first urban planning documents were not disseminated until the rehabilitation phase (2012–2017). This discrepancy is partly due to the fact that implementing agencies lacked expertise in urban planning, but also due to the necessity to establish participatory processes to provide area-specific databases with useful information and to ensure institutional legitimacy.

This new approach required humanitarian response actors to produce urban analyses and a forward-looking vision of the area. It prompted the implementing agencies to ‘test’ new methods during a crisis situation and under the pressure of urgency. “Based on the notion of community, the methodologies developed first proved inadequate

<sup>25</sup> The smallest scale of urban planning envisaged by the Haitian regulatory framework is the municipality and not the neighbourhood.

<sup>26</sup> This is not true for projects whose participatory planning has been understood by the organisation as having objectives other than the production of urban planning documents. Case Study 2, and the project set up by Concern Worldwide within the framework of the PARAQ programme, are examples of such an approach.

to the notion of 'neighbourhood', which includes a mosaic of socio-economic realities" (Flores and Jarrot, 2016). This exercise was very complicated due to the lack of an institutional framework for planning, urban planning, and citizen participation. Public institutions, lacking sufficient human or technical resources, soon found themselves overburdened with requests from organisations.

Ultimately, the definition of concepts and preparation of planning documents required extensive adaptation to facilitate understanding between humanitarian response organisations, local institutions, and urban planners. The concept of an urban development plan, normally developed at the municipal or regional level,<sup>27</sup> had thus been adapted to integrate the components necessary for humanitarian response. The urban planning documents therefore incorporated elements of analysis about the return of displaced populations<sup>28</sup> and the recycling of debris generated by earthquake damage, or the repair and reconstruction of buildings.

These reflections, which are more connected to project implementation rather than to strategic planning, appear to stem from participatory approaches where people have received invitations to share information about their individual needs. Land considerations (e.g. delimitations of private and state land, land reserves, or land opportunities) are generally understood to be difficult subjects to address in Haiti,<sup>29</sup> particularly during a participatory process; therefore there is very little information on this within the urban planning documents analysed in this study. Zones targeted by the rehabilitation programme due to operational considerations (land release and expropriation in particular) are exempt from these comments. Several urban planning documents resulted from processes in which training activities for residents were omitted, generally due to a lack of time, and were configured as needs assessments rather than as expressions of a collective vision.

---

<sup>27</sup> Article 93 in the decree of 2006, which defines the framework of decentralisation in the Haitian law, provides for the implementation of municipal and urban planning schemes discussed and approved by the municipal assembly.

<sup>28</sup> Project 16/6 is based on the concept that urban reconstruction could function as an incentive for displaced populations to return to their neighbourhood of origin.

<sup>29</sup> Regularisation of land tenure for inhabitants of at-risk neighbourhoods is often a main component of urban regeneration initiatives in informal environments. 'Pilot' initiatives were excluded in post-earthquake recovery projects. They would have required more resources and specialised skills, as well as more time to implement.

# The Scale

The urban planning and rehabilitation projects targeted neighbourhoods ranging in size from 8 to 135 hectares, and located in one of the municipalities of the Port-au-Prince metropolitan area.<sup>30</sup>

As described above, the use of the neighbourhood as the scale for intervention and planning was primarily related to operational and financial reasons, and was not supported by a legal framework. In the majority of cases, the targeted areas included multiple neighbourhoods<sup>31</sup> or small territories, identified by residents through toponyms that were often inherited from rural dwellings, whose boundaries depend on topographical features or historical events.

The participatory mapping exercise allowed the identification of inconsistencies between the boundaries of the space experienced by residents and official topographic maps registered by the National Centre for Geo-Spatial Information (The Centre National de l'Information Géo-Spatiale – CNGIS).<sup>32</sup> These provide a better understanding of 'segregation' in precarious areas where natural limits, in the absence of connective infrastructure, can translate to very deep divisions between communities in close proximity. However, small development projects linked to accessibility improvements have great potential in these cases.

The areas of intervention were subject to a validation process involving the government and donors. These have prioritised municipalities in the metropolitan areas most affected by the earthquake and by internal displacement, such as Delmas, Carrefour, Port-au-Prince, and Petion-ville. In the absence of an "urban planning framework that would have increased the coherence of rehabilitation projects at the local level and guided newly urbanising areas" (Global Facility for Disaster Reduction and Recovery, 2016), and without genuine institutional steering, the development plans collected major inputs from the

residents on their vision for the neighbourhoods. However, if participation is essential to understanding a neighbourhood's internal functioning and specific needs, it can provide little input into reflections on inter-neighbourhood links or functioning across the metropolis. "The solution to the low standards in the slums cannot be found in isolated slum upgrading projects, but requires the development of the whole metropolitan Port-au-Prince. Slum prevention could also be achieved through proper use of planning tools such as spatial plans and regulations on land subdivision" (UN Human Settlements Programme, 2010).

The lack of a comprehensive framework that would have allowed directing and justifying action towards certain zones has at times led to conflict. Indeed, during initial programme implementation stages, the lack of justification had repercussions in neighbouring communities whose residents did not understand why their areas were not selected (an example of districts selected in Carrefour can be found in Case Study 3).

However, the scale of planning put in place by the organisations appears appropriate to meet project objectives as well as more general participation goals (both educational and social). The chosen scale enabled the organisations to work with several communities simultaneously, thus leading them to reflect on their relationships within a 'neighbourhood' as well as with the rest of the city. It also enabled organisations to better understand and more accurately describe the socio-economic complexities of the urban environment, and the limited resources available to them. **Table 1** represents the scale of urban planning covered by the case studies analysed in this report. The case studies involve a similar number of inhabitants, and areas of similar size, in order to ease the comparison between approaches and methodologies for participatory planning activities.

---

<sup>30</sup>The most extended area of activity is that of the participatory urban development study in the Martissant ZAC, which covers 885 hectares (ha). This study was commissioned in 2011 by FOKAL, MTPTC, CIAT, and GRET, and was carried out by the ACT-LGL group. Another very extensive area of activity is Carrefour-Feuilles, which covers 135 ha. The study was carried out by the WE-SPORA-LGL group, after being authorised in 2012 by the Bureau of Monetisation of Development Assistance Programs (BMPAD) within the framework of the PRODEPUR-Habitat programme.

<sup>31</sup>The community, not the 'district', is the smallest administrative unit of the Republic of Haiti. This division is typical of rural environments but is also used in urban areas.

<sup>32</sup>For ten districts of the Port-au-Prince metropolitan area, the clarification of neighbourhood boundaries and place names that was carried out in conjunction with community members during participatory urban planning projects is included in the SILQ project of the National Center for Urban Planning, Geo-Spatial Information (CNGIS) ([http://cnigs.ht/silq/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=18](http://cnigs.ht/silq/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=18)).

The compromise that resulted from participatory workshops which included residents of adjacent areas has encouraged positive dynamics between adjoining neighbourhoods. It also facilitated new social and collaborative relationships between CBOs that continue nearly three years after the programme ended. These connections have contributed to reducing segregation between the communities: “exchanges of ideas with the others allow us to better identify the problems of

the whole zone”, said a representative of the Nérette community platform (referring to exchanges with Morne Lazarre and Morne Hercule). Workshops aiming to identify boundaries for the intervention area also allowed people to identify themselves as a group sharing a common vision within a wider territory. They were then able to present themselves as a more influential group during exchanges with authorities.

**Table 1. Scale of Urban Planning in Case Studies<sup>33</sup>**

	<b>Case Study 1 (Morne Lazarre and Nérette*)</b>	<b>Case Study 2 (Haut-Turgeau and Debussy)</b>	<b>Case Study 3 (Ti-Sous, Grenada, Sapotille and Aztek)</b>	<b>Case Study 4 (Christ the King)</b>
Population of the neighbourhood	21,600 inhabitants	21,400 inhabitants	32,000 inhabitants	20,000 inhabitants
Approximate area of the territory analysed	98 hectares	190 hectares	128 hectares	80 hectares
Population density or building density	220 inhabitants/ hectare	On average more than 70 buildings / hectare	60 buildings / hectare	400 inhabitants/ hectare

\*Data refer to the residents of Morne Hercule, Morne Lazarre, and Nérette. Morne Hercule’s platform did not participate in the discussion workshops conducted as part of this research.

<sup>33</sup>The data presented in the table are extracted from the urban planning documents in the case studies.

# The Role of Actors

The range of stakeholders associated with rehabilitation projects is wide, complex, and specific to each case study. In the context of this study, the research team had to restrict their analysis to actors who have participated actively in the process of planning on the neighbourhood scale, as defined in the previous chapter. The main actors of the participatory planning process are thus represented by: the Haitian authorities (local and national), NGOs (project leaders or technical units responsible for implementation of planning activities), and civil society in its various representations (community platforms, associations, or the entire target population).

## The Haitian Authorities

The local and national Haitian authorities, which have limited experience with integrating citizens' views into policy development, have been part of the entire urban planning process – although international organisations involved in reconstruction remained responsible for its implementation. As mentioned previously (see 'Context: The Urban Crisis and the Need for Social Dialogue'), the participatory planning approaches used between 2012 and 2016 represented a significant change in practice for Haitian authorities. For Rose-May Guignard,<sup>34</sup> Senior Planner at the Technical Secretariat of CIAT, "the Haitian Government was able for the first time [to] experiment [with] a decision mechanism that includes national and local agencies, the municipality, and the representatives of Community platforms"<sup>35</sup> in order to arrive at a logical and coordinated set of actions required for improving conditions in slum neighbourhoods.

## The Involvement of National Institutions

At the national level, the Interministerial Committee for Territorial Management (CIAT), created in 2009, sets government policy in several areas: regional development, watershed protection and management, water management, sanitation, urban planning, and infrastructure. This Committee was created in

response to the urgent need to identify and implement evidence-based and coordinated actions between public institutions involved in urban development. After the earthquake, CIAT committed itself to guiding the participatory processes of reconstruction within the existing neighbourhoods, as well as the process of urban and regional planning. It was actively involved in a range of coordination mechanisms facilitating the humanitarian response, and produced various specialised publications and two guides (CIAT, 2013) that targeted stakeholders involved in reconstruction.

In November 2011, the Housing and Public Buildings Construction Unit (Unité de Construction de Logements et des Bâtiments Publics – UCLBP) was established as an office attached to the Office of the Prime Minister, with a mandate to oversee the coordination and implementation of construction projects for public buildings and housing across Haiti. It also guided government efforts in urban planning, and often collaborated with the CIAT to support, monitor, and guide non-state actors involved in the reconstruction.

These two institutions have been the main government actors involved in implementing participatory approaches in slum neighbourhoods. The UCLBP invested mostly in the participatory process for project 16/6,<sup>36</sup> as it had assumed responsibility to control the reconstruction activities of "16 neighbourhoods in order to improve living conditions through community participation" (UNDP-Haiti, accessed 2017).

CIAT and UCLBP followed the progress closely throughout the participatory neighbourhood development processes, and this led to 'citizen participation' becoming part of the institutional vocabulary. However, it should be emphasised that in 2006, the government published the Charter of Local Authorities, which aims, among other things, to "promote development at the grassroots and foster participation through local governance".<sup>37</sup> This is a little-known charter and did not seem to have had a significant impact on public institutions' practices

---

<sup>34</sup> Interview with Rose-May Guignard, Senior Planner to the Technical Secretariat of CIAT, May 2017.

<sup>35</sup> An overview of the work carried out in the framework of the PARAQ <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KTcsZVGW3Zo&t=186s>, published on 7 December 2016.

<sup>36</sup> The programme is implemented with the support of the United Nations through four of its agencies: the UN Development Programme (UNDP), the International Labour Organisation (ILO), the International Organisation for Migration (IOM), and the UN Office for Project Services (UNOPS).

<sup>37</sup> Charter of the local authorities, Executive order framework, Book I, Chapter I, Article 2, the Republic of Haiti, 2006. The limits of implementation in the urban environment of this Decree framework are analysed by Garry Lhérisson in *Principles, Regulations & Operational Tools of the Haitian Legislation on Urban Development*, 2015.

until after the earthquake. Additionally, when the UCLBP published the *National Housing Policy, Habitat and Urban Development* (PNLH) in 2013, in order to guide reconstruction (particularly housing), it called upon civil society and the “collective actors working in the development of their territories” to support local authorities in order to “participate in the development, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of the PNLH programmes” (PNLH, 2013).

Unlike the UCLBP, CIAT does not have an operational mandate, and therefore has not implemented reconstruction projects. However, it weighed heavily on the establishment of participatory urban planning processes. For Rose-May Guignard, “the concept of [the] participatory process has been a major innovation in the Haitian context, where the approach was [previously] largely technocratic.”<sup>38</sup>

Most of the urban planning participatory projects that began between 2013 and 2016 followed the process indicated by the guide. The validation committee, which was controlled by the CIAT’s Technical Secretariat, set up a mechanism for dialogue between reconstruction organisations, those who performed community analyses based on the participatory processes, and other institutional actors. This space for dialogue that integrates political, technical, and citizen views represents both a clear step forward in management and urban planning processes in Haiti, and a significant paradigm change for the institutions.

A change in practice can be also observed in the *Professional Guide to Neighbourhood rehabilitation: The steps of the urban planning* – a document compiled in 2013 by CIAT, the MTPTC, and the UCLBP. It presents urban diagnostics as the first step that “allows understanding the vision of the inhabitants and neighbourhood users, thanks to participatory methodologies. Although essential for the understanding of specific issues of different neighbourhoods, this vision should also integrate the analysis and the technical expertise of professionals. The urban diagnostic must reveal this double reading” (CIAT *et al.*, 2012).

Although this document is an important first step, it lacks legal power and does not envision a role for civil society in the validation of urban planning documents.

## The Commitment of Local Authorities

Three of the case studies demonstrate the active participation of local institutions in the urban planning process. Members of the town hall and local administrative agencies, such as the Governing Body of the Communal Section (Conseil d’Administration de la Section Communale – CASEC) and town delegates, appeared to be widely involved in the diagnostic and planning workshop.<sup>39</sup>

In Case Study 2 (Haut Turgeau et Debussy), the participatory approach focused on communication between civil society and local authorities through planning workshops. This helped to legitimise and stimulate dialogue between actors involved in neighbourhood development. Although initially the authorities could not access the communities, the participatory processes gradually bridged the distance between them. Still, according to a representative from the municipality of Port-au-Prince, this process was “slow and certainly not obvious.”<sup>40</sup>

The commitment of municipalities during project implementation in some cases turned into genuine partnership formalised by an agreement between the organisation and the town hall, as seen in case studies 3 and 4. In certain major development projects, such as the construction of roads or the rehabilitation of ravines, the town councils of Port-au-Prince and Carrefour guided the expropriation and compensation of resident households. The town halls were in dialogue with international organisations in order to assist communities and protect their interests in the event of conflict. Municipal participation in recovery projects has resulted in a greater understanding of the issues affecting programme success in slum neighbourhoods, higher levels of compromise and active assistance,<sup>41</sup> and in the recognition that planning laws are not always suitable to conditions within slum neighbourhoods.

The participatory experience does not appear to have sustainably improved relationships between residents and local authorities, despite efforts at coordination. Participants who were initially very positive about the opportunities for exchange and collaboration that were created by recovery projects reported that these ended after the project was completed, and that dialogue

---

<sup>38</sup> Interview with Rose-May Guignard, Senior Planner to the Technical Secretariat of the CIAT, May 2017.

<sup>39</sup> In Case Study 3 (Carrefour), the agents of the Local Technical Agency, who were attached to the Carrefour Town Hall, participated regularly in the meetings and in the definition of the working strategy due to their mission. They were already actively involved in rehabilitation activities and community development. This allowed for productive discussion between organisations and the population on the choice of projects and their impacts on the neighborhood.

<sup>40</sup> Interview with Rodrigue Fils Sully Guerrier, former Director of Development and Land Management, Port-au-Prince Town Hall, May 2017.

<sup>41</sup> Ibid.

ceased entirely when new local officials were elected.<sup>42</sup> This is highly relevant, as no new urban rehabilitation initiatives have been established in these areas in the last two years (2016–2017).

## Non-Governmental Organisations

Most participatory planning processes that took place from 2010 to 2016 were implemented through non-governmental or UN organisations that led or provided technical assistance on urban renewal projects. A participatory methodology was implemented in these projects after the earthquake “as a preferred pathway of programmatic entry in areas requiring significant reconstruction work” (UN Habitat, forthcoming), while also creating social acceptance and facilitating project implementation. Humanitarian organisations viewed participatory planning as a way to establish a coherent project and produce basic data. In addition, it helped legitimise their actions in the absence of local institutions (See case studies 2, 3, and 4), supported the development of local democratic processes and improved relationships with institutions. As a result, organisations followed the rules and development plans set by the CIAT document (CIAT *et al.*, 2012), with support from the town hall and administrative organisations.

Although the legitimacy of such non-state actors has been called into question in light of their nature, status, or authority (Lombart *et al.*, 2014), there is acknowledgement of their expertise in community-based approaches.<sup>43</sup> This expertise, combined with a politically neutral role, has allowed humanitarian organisations to operate within existing social structures in slum neighbourhoods, and to initiate debate around urban improvement with the main organisations involved in rebuilding. Their presence also eased the dialogue between residents and town halls. The participation of local authorities that resulted from these activities has reintroduced them into informal settlements, along with their capabilities in building and urban planning standards.<sup>44</sup>

Therefore, the role of NGOs in the planning process remained ambiguous despite institutional coordination efforts. This was particularly because of urban recovery

projects that were created without including state services for urban development.

## Civil Society: The Residents of Slum Neighbourhoods

According to Groupe URD, “communities waver, sometimes overlapping in their interests, sometimes disconnected from or even opposing each other” (Corbet, 2012). In describing the reasons for slum residents’ involvement in participatory urban planning activities, we cannot ignore their interests as individuals.

Recovery programmes have led the population hit by the 2010 earthquake to identify humanitarian action as an opportunity to strengthen family economies, and as an opportunity to emerge as leaders through their knowledge of and interaction with NGOs (Corbet, 2012). The main focus areas for implementing agencies were ensuring the representation of all members of the community – thereby balancing the presence of *leaders ecrans* (apparent leaders) (Corbet 2012) – and facilitating a collective understanding of the objectives of information exchange and active participation in the workshops.

Three types of processes have been used by organisations to select participants for the planning process in slum neighbourhoods:

- A participatory space exclusively for members of the neighbourhood community platform (Case Study 1);
- Participation by ‘invitation’, based on a deep understanding of social structure and on a solid relationship with the community (Case Study 2);
- Selection of participants following a call for applications addressed to the entire population (case studies 3 and 4). After the application process, participants were selected based on criteria of diversity and representativeness similar to those used in the ‘invitation’ process.

**Table 2** shows the number of participants in planning activities, relative to the total population of the neighbourhood(s) and criteria for representativeness.

<sup>42</sup> This view was widely shared among participants in two of the four case-study workshops. In the case of the platforms of Morne Lazare and Nérette, one of the members of the platform of Morne Lazare was elected city delegate for the municipality of Pétion-Ville. In the case of Carrefour, it was the Mayor of the Commune.

<sup>43</sup> Information from interviews with Rose-May Guignard and Rodrigue Fils Sully Guerrier, May 2017.

<sup>44</sup> The neighbourhood of Grand Ravine has been deserted by the Haitian authorities since the 1980s due to gang violence: within the framework of the PARAQ programme, representatives of the town hall are ‘authorised’ to participate in planning activities with the community platform and their presence in the neighbourhood is ‘tolerated’. (Source: Case study: CONCERN on Grand Ravine, Process, Success and Lessons Learned, Support Programme for Neighbourhood Reconstruction and Development (unpublished).)

**Table 2. Civil Society Participation in Urban Planning of Slum Neighbourhoods: Quantity and Representativeness**

	<b>Case Study #1 (Morne Lazarre and Nerette)</b>	<b>Case Study #2 (Haut-Turgeau and Debussy)</b>	<b>Case Study #3 (Ti-Sous, Grenada, Sapotille and Aztèk)</b>	<b>Case Study #4 (Christ-Roi)</b>
Total population	21,600 inhabitants	21,400 inhabitants	32,000 inhabitants	20,000 inhabitants
Number of inhabitants involved in diagnosis and planning workshops	65 adults (all members of three platforms)	120 adults of a total 180 invited	150 adults (100 for workshops, 50 in activities targeting specific groups)	Urban profile: 56 adults, 12 children Urban development plan: 138 people groups
Representativeness	<p>The representativeness of the participatory process reflects the composition of the neighbourhood community platform: groups of elders; representatives of camps for displaced; groups of young people; persons with disabilities; public figures; religious groups; grassroots organisations and local NGOs; representatives of the education sector; representatives of the health sector; women's organisations.</p> <p>The platform members participated in problem diagnostics and urban planning.</p>	<p>Diagnostic/urban profile: criteria of representativeness of different social groups adapted to each theme, aiming to integrate the people most vulnerable in the context of the urban problem under consideration.</p> <p>The number of people invited to each workshop for each zone has been defined in proportion to the total inhabitants of the area.</p> <p>For the planning workshops, community representatives were selected according to their commitment and involvement in the previous phase.</p>	<p>Out of 650 voluntary applications, 100 participants were selected according to representativeness criteria for areas and social groups.</p> <p>To enhance participation beyond thematic workshops, other specific workshops and activities with women, youth, children, and persons with reduced mobility were carried out.</p> <p>The same people participated in the diagnostic and planning activities.</p>	<p>Diagnostic/urban profile: open participation</p> <p>Urban development plan: criteria of representativeness according to social groups (public figures; CBO representatives; participants in the diagnostic phase) and by target area (5 areas identified during the diagnostic phase).</p>
Average participation of women	34 per cent of members across three platforms	42 per cent of participants	34 per cent of participants	Urban profile: 56 per cent of participants Development plan: 31 per cent of participants

The actors that were part of the process largely fit the profile of conventional leaders; other categories would have been interesting to consider, particularly within the formal economic sector, the private sector, and the academic sector.

## Women

Women's voices are generally underrepresented within traditional community groups (particularly CBOs), although they carry important weight in the internal function of the neighbourhood. The key challenge in this field lies in the development of specific mobilisation activities for various organisations and women's groups. This is needed in order to promote the exchange of ideas without discrimination, and to allow for free expression of women's exposure to hazards and daily access to basic services.<sup>45</sup>

Women attendees<sup>46</sup> explained that they participated in the workshops in order to become active, voice their opinions, articulate issues they face in their daily lives, and identify needs specific to them. "The first day, I vaguely understood the goal, but after, I thought it was so important that I found the time. [...] It is an activity that I have loved."<sup>47</sup> The proportion of women participating in all planning workshops<sup>48</sup> was close to 30 per cent for each case study.

## Community Platforms in Urban Planning

Community platforms<sup>49</sup> are designed to represent all neighbourhood residents in order to facilitate their active involvement in urban planning and development. They have been provided with training to ensure that members are chosen based on representativeness and commitment to the community. During the implementation of the case study projects, platform members were given a voluntary mission to work intensively with the technical organisations in charge of urban planning.<sup>50</sup>

The debate on the legitimacy and functionality of the platforms has not yet been resolved. Some view the platforms as "extraordinary tools of governance and accountability, able to increase *inclusion* and communities' participation in the management of the City" (Universalia, 2015), advocating that they should be legitimised and/or institutionalised. Others believe that "to avoid favouritism, platforms must remain linked to their spontaneous and self-managed format."<sup>51</sup> There is a risk that these local participatory structures will become political bodies that oppose the municipality. Similarly, they may also become "political tools for the authorities of the municipality" (Universalia, 2015).

Among the three case studies where organisations have either established or worked with community platforms, only one (Case Study 1) remains functional three years after completion of the project. In the case of Haut-Turgeon, a CBO representative characterises the platform as "stillborn", adding that "the mission given to the platform was clear, but it was not shared by its members."<sup>52</sup> The functions and representativeness of the platforms are closely linked to the people that comprise them. For example, some members may oppose the free sharing of information (in an attempt to centralise power), and this suppresses other voices in the community. For the purposes of participatory planning, it appears preferable to create spaces and mechanisms of participation, rather than representative bodies. It might be interesting to think of these mechanisms from a digital perspective in order to ensure 'real-time' data and updates about the urban planning process.<sup>53</sup>

<sup>45</sup> "Women tend to focus on the daily management of the household (house cleaning, cooking, child-rearing) and on local trade." (Corbet, 2012)

<sup>46</sup> The women interviewed were mostly charismatic women – community leaders, who told the stories of their contribution to reconstruction activities after the earthquake, and of their participation throughout the process of urban regeneration until the work was completed.

<sup>47</sup> Statement made during the workshop discussion with women for Case Study 3 (Ti-Sous, Grenada, Sapotille and Azték), May 2017.

<sup>48</sup> In effect, most organisations did not take into account the conditions that facilitate the participation of groups traditionally excluded from public discussions. This was due to time constraints, the fact that objectives were very focused on project needs, or due to cultural factors.

<sup>49</sup> These platforms were established and guided by UN-Habitat within the framework of 19 projects sponsored by the organisation (UN-Habitat, 2014).

<sup>50</sup> In Case Study 1, members of community platforms participated in more than 20 workshops that took place on a weekly basis for 6 months.

<sup>51</sup> Interview with Rodrigue Fils Sully Guerrier, former Director of Development and Land Management, Port-au-Prince Town Hall, May 2017.

<sup>52</sup> Interview with representative of the CBO Novic of Haut-Turgeon (Case Study 2), May 2017.

<sup>53</sup> To better understand the opportunities created by a digital platform, it is interesting to look at the experience of Barrio Digital in the municipality of La Paz, Bolivia: through a dedicated online platform, communities are invited to give their opinion on, and report potential problems with, initiatives to improve basic urban services set up by authorities. The platform is a device that keeps active the link between authorities and residents of disadvantaged neighbourhoods of the Bolivian capital (<http://barriodigital.lapaz.bo/>).

# Time

Due to the lack of an institutional framework, the points in time when residents of the slum neighbourhood could participate in the urban planning process were defined according to organisations' objectives and methods. As programmes consisted mainly of operational<sup>54</sup> planning exercises, the timing of participatory activities corresponded to that of the urban rehabilitation programme: diagnostics, design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation. Activities carried out by organisations include: initial information, urban diagnostics/problem identification, planning and prioritisation of actions, and implementation of priority projects. No participatory evaluation activities have been identified.<sup>55</sup>

Dissemination of results is a critical aspect of participatory planning. Such dissemination was very limited.<sup>56</sup> In the absence of follow-up activities, the considerable amount of information produced on slum neighbourhoods may be lost.

The interaction and training mechanisms implemented by each organisation vary, and depend on their programme's methods, resources, and specific objectives. Nevertheless, two main principles have emerged:

- Community participation was used as an effective tool for achieving specific objectives such as the production of operational planning schemes (as in case studies 1, 3 and 4).<sup>57</sup>
- Community participation,<sup>58</sup> as an objective in itself, can be combined with other specific objectives such as community reinforcement (as in Case Study 2).

In the latter case, the process tends to develop a culture of participation with the objective of building the capacity of local civil society. The participation of neighbourhood residents is then used by the organisation to define urban planning, and the planning work contributes, in turn, to capacity-building. This approach offers multiple learning opportunities and long-term effects connected with participation in planning workshops. But it requires a significant amount of time, and specific resources and methods.

**Table 3** summarises mechanisms and actions performed by different organisations, rated by level of participation in the different stages: information, consultation, dialogue, and involvement.

---

<sup>54</sup>The planning exercises were all related to a project to be implemented in the short-term.

<sup>55</sup>"Participation is understood as the involvement of crisis-affected populations in one or more aspects of the humanitarian response project or programme: diagnosis, design, implementation, monitoring or evaluation". (Source: Groupe URD's Handbook for Humanitarian Participation, 2012)

<sup>56</sup>In case studies 2 and 3, the urban development plan was presented to the population through public meetings in the neighbourhood. At the time of this research, GOAL (Case Study 2) had begun translating an extract of the urban planning documentation into Creole.

<sup>57</sup>According to the definition of Groupe URD, "The community approach therefore has as a pillar the participation of the targeted population in the implementation of an activity initiated by an NGO". (Group URD, 2012)

<sup>58</sup>In case studies 2 and 3, the management plan was presented to the population through public meetings in the neighbourhood. At the time of this research, GOAL (Case Study 2) had begun translating an extract of the layout plan into Creole.

**Table 3. Activities Developed in the Urban Planning Process**

	Case Study 1 (Morne Lazarre and Nérétte)	Case Study 2 (Haut Turgeau and Debussy)	Case Study 3 (Ti-Sous, Grenada, Sapotille and Aztek)	Case Study 4 (Christ-Roi)
Information (initially and during project)	<p>Training of community platforms</p> <p>Meetings with community platforms</p> <p>Briefing on the priority projects to be implemented hold by community platforms members</p>	<p>Public meetings</p> <p>Invitation and follow-up for participatory workshops</p> <p>Weekly presence in the neighbourhood</p> <p>Meetings with platforms</p> <p>Presentation of the diagnostic and urban development plan to the population.</p> <p>Translation of the urban planning documentation in Creole.</p> <p>13 public exchange meetings on the Preliminary Urban Development Plan (400 participants in total)</p>	<p>Poster campaign</p> <p>Call for applications for participation in planning workshops (Duration: 7 days)</p> <p>Documents on the planning process translated into Creole</p> <p>Presentation of the diagnostic and urban development plan for the population</p> <p>Briefing on priority projects to be implemented</p>	<p>Poster campaign</p> <p>A festive march to launch planning workshops</p> <p>Creating a slogan</p> <p>Bi-monthly presentation of project progress</p> <p>Permanence in the neighbourhood</p>
Consultation	<p>Participatory mapping</p> <p>10 workshops with each of 3 platforms (diagnosis and development projects), divided between:</p> <p>6 thematic workshops;</p> <p>4 workshops with specific actors in the neighbourhoods (women, the elderly, young people, the education and health sector, actors in the local economy).</p> <p>3 validation workshops (diagnostic and development projects)</p> <p>Presentation and validation of priority projects to communities by community platforms</p>	<p>Participatory mapping</p> <p>Comprehensive household survey</p> <p>6 workshops for reflection and work (1 per theme)</p> <p>Availability on a weekly basis for discussion and collection of the data</p> <p>Individual interviews</p>	<p>Participatory mapping</p> <p>4,000 household surveys</p> <p>18 diagnostic workshops (3 for each theme, total of 6)</p> <p>Individual interviews</p> <p>Exploratory walks with specific groups (women and children)</p>	<p>Participatory mapping</p> <p>475 household surveys</p> <p>5 workshops for reflection and work (diagnosis)</p> <p>Individual interviews</p>
Dialogue	<p>2 synthesis workshops with civil society, experts, and local authorities to arrive at collective definition of priority intervention and long-term vision</p> <p>Presentation and validation of the diagnostic and urban development plan at CIAT with institutions, experts, and authorities involved</p>	<p>18 planning workshops (3 for each the 6 themes): Consultation and prioritisation of projects by the population and local authorities</p> <p>Presentation and validation of diagnosis and prioritisation of projects</p> <p>Presentation and validation of the diagnostic and urban development plan at CIAT with institutions, experts and authorities involved</p>	<p>30 planning workshops with the population:</p> <p>validation and consultation without clear decision-making authority</p> <p>Presentation and validation of the diagnostic and development plan (community portrait) to CIAT with the institutions, experts and authorities involved</p>	

	Case Study 1 (Morne Lazarre and N�ette)	Case Study 2 (Haut Turgeau and Debussy)	Case Study 3 (Ti-Sous, Grenada, Sapotille and Aztek)	Case Study 4 (Christ-Roi)
Involvement	Implementation of major development projects by the private sector  Community-driven implementation of small public spaces  On-the-job training for residential buildings	Implementation of major development projects by the private sector  Community-driven implementation of small public spaces  Homeowner-driven construction for individual dwellings	Implementation of major development projects by the private sector  Community-driven implementation of small public spaces	Implementation of major development projects by the private sector  Community-driven implementation of small public spaces  Homeowner-driven construction and on-the-job training for individual dwellings
Programmatic information				
Population	21,600 inhabitants	21,400 inhabitants (Haut-Turgeau population)	32,000 inhabitants	20,000 inhabitants
Duration of the planning process (outside of validation procedure)	10 months (January-October 2012)	11 months (December 2014–November 2015)	6 months (June 2013–January 2014)	10 months (February–November 2013)
Human resources mobilised (internal and external, technical and social team)	1 project leader, 1 town planner by district, 2 facilitators, 5 interviewers	1 project coordinator, 1 project manager, 2 urban planners, 1 urban planning assistant, 1 GIS expert, 4 facilitators, 20 interviewers (working in groups of two as per the NGO's internal policy)	1 project leader, 2 urban planners, 2 community mobilisers, 1 hydrologist specialist, 1 field assistant	Community Mobilisation Team (Solidarit�s): 4 mobilisers, 1 technical manager  Team for the Development Plan: 1 planner, 1 engineer, 1 cartographer, 1 facilitator

## Initial Information

The urban planning process begins when the organisation enters<sup>59</sup> the neighbourhood. Therefore, the initial information becomes a fundamental means of tracing the social structure of the community from the outset. Poor structures of social organisation in the neighbourhoods may present major obstacles to implementing activities. These might include conflicts between representative neighbourhood groups and residents, conflicts of power and territorial interests, and problems in the communication of information. The case studies demonstrated that this stage was based first and foremost on contact with community leaders and registered CBOs. However, it is necessary

to widen the scope of the community actors who are involved. This is evidenced by the Parc of Martissant<sup>60</sup> project, implemented from 2008 onwards, whose remarkable mechanism of establishment in the community, the 'talk spaces', was initiated by the Foundation for Knowledge and Liberty (FOKAL). This space encouraged discussion between the organisation and the community, while facilitating its objectives of informing and advising. This approach is driven by the following key principles: sustainability, safety, hygiene, and the preservation of a public park located in a dense and informal urban area, depending on the behaviour of area residents, future park users, and those responsible for the environment surrounding the park.

<sup>59</sup>Terminology used by participants in mixed and women-only workshops.

<sup>60</sup>Project involving Martissant park ([www.parcdemartissant.org/](http://www.parcdemartissant.org/)): FOKAL provided a meeting space in the park's fields and coordinated the thematic discussions. From 2008 to 2012, members of Martissant's grassroots organisations took part in meetings twice a week to reflect and exchange views on how the problems of their neighbourhoods may relate to the functioning of the public park. The meetings had a standard format that provided for two-and-a-half hours of discussion and a maximum of 12 participants per session.

## Urban Diagnostics

In the view of the organisations involved, civil society participation in the urban diagnostics phase aims to achieve three objectives: build the neighbourhood profile; raise residents' awareness of needs and territorial issues; and facilitate residents' active participation in later phases of planning.

The lack of data on the areas involved had a strong influence on the orientation of participatory workshops, which focused on producing precise information on targeted neighbourhoods. **Table 4** highlights documents, developed as part of the case studies, for making an urban diagnostic; it also highlights the type of participation requested from residents.

### Making an Urban Diagnostic

The forms of participation that residents were involved in are dictated by contextual factors. Comprehensive data production was prioritised in order to obtain

a deep understanding of the area in terms of geographical characteristics, and to identify its social dynamics. Through this approach, residents felt very much involved in the production of urban planning documents. This exercise emerges as a meaningful public dialogue that promotes consideration of people's needs, expectations, and knowledge of their communities. The exchange of ideas allows for a more comprehensive understanding of the area and better collective identification of problems across adjacent areas within the entire targeted zone.<sup>61</sup>

**Table 5** illustrates the priority themes that emerged from urban diagnostics within the case studies (the content of the planning workshops was designed to follow up on these themes).<sup>62</sup>

Various participatory mechanisms were used to produce the information required for diagnosis: interactive mapping exercises, thematic workshops, field visits, and exploratory walks. The mapping that resulted from these activities shaped subsequent workshops, which focused on the strengths,

**Table 4: Participation in the Development of Urban Diagnostics**

Diagnostic documents	Objectives of the diagnostic product	Participation of residents in the development of documents
Census of social structure in the district	Collect information on the presence and activities of grassroots organisations and associations in the area.	Process generally guided by the organisation, with the support of leading figures within the zone. An information process is put in place to encourage CBOs to register their presence in the area with the organisation.
Built database for results of a household survey	Collect socio-economic information about the residents of the neighbourhood.	Community members are trained and hired as investigators.
Sector studies	Produce technical information about natural hazards related to the topography of the area.	Natural hazards recognition workshops in the neighbourhood, and basic training on risks.
Neighbourhood mapping	Build shared geographic knowledge of the neighbourhood.	Interactive maps production during workshops: mental maps, location of services and public spaces, mapping of perceived risks and past disasters.
Strengths, Weaknesses, Opportunities, and Threats analysis (SWOT)	Analyse and build consensus around strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, risks. Understand the perceptions and initiatives of the community, taking into account the technical and geographic information collected.	Information developed during workshops. In some cases, local authorities participated in these workshops.

<sup>61</sup> Intervention during the mixed discussion workshop for Case Study 1 (Morne Lazaarre, Nérette), May 2017.

<sup>62</sup> The data presented are based on case-study planning documents and/or information gathered from implementing agencies.

**Table 5. The Priority Themes of Urban Diagnostics**

Case study 1	Case study 2	Case Study 3	Case Study 4
Natural hazards	Roads, mobility, and travel	Environment, natural hazards, ravine, urban agriculture	Limits of the neighbourhood
Accessibility and travel	Environmental and risk management	Roads, mobility, transport, street lighting, public spaces	Environmental cleanliness
Urban networks and services	Housing, living conditions, and land	Shelter, urban services: water, electricity, waste, sanitation	Functionality and accessibility
Equipment and services for the population	Access to basic services	Facilities: health, education, culture, sport, worship	Spaces to socialise
Public spaces	Facilities for public and local areas	Economy: trade, crafts, industry, services	Economic dynamics
Commercial and craft activities	Activities and socio-economic context		Housing
Housing			

weaknesses, opportunities and risks in parts of the neighbourhood, and defined the strategic axes for planning and development in the short term.

The process of generating information (for organisations as well as neighbourhood residents) was developed through mapping exercises, following Kevin Lynch's landmark concept (Lynch, 1960). A resident of Christ-Roi made this comment: "Thanks to this, we have [the] support to recognise the real problems of the neighbourhood and the weaknesses of the community".<sup>63</sup>

### Multiplying the Voices of the Community in Urban Diagnostics

Participatory planning can exacerbate exclusion by defining and limiting who can participate in advance. Importantly, case studies 3 and 4 opted to begin their activities through an open selection process. Strengthening the voice of the community by including traditionally excluded groups such as women, young people, or children, is not only critical to achieving a comprehensive picture of the neighbourhood, but also for making the participatory process more democratic and inclusive. Women, in particular, are able to identify critical aspects of improving neighbourhood conditions and their daily lives: security, access to water and health services, the local economy, and housing.

Participatory activities specific to women and children were developed in case studies 3 and 4. In Carrefour, the programme placed women at the centre of its analysis relating to security of public spaces. To

that end, an exploratory walk of 1.5 kilometres was organised with a group of 10 women, during which they highlighted issues related to security including cases of rape, theft, and measures that women have developed to avoid insecurity while traveling on foot. The organisation facilitated these reflections by providing questionnaires for women to complete during the journey. A workshop was then conducted to enable women to collectively reflect and discuss their vision of the neighbourhood.

A similar technique was used to highlight the behaviour of children in public spaces (see case studies 3 and 4). The organisation observed the movements of children during leisure activities, when going to school, or while getting water. Mental mapping exercises in the form of drawings also revealed their perceptions.<sup>64</sup>

### Impacts of Diagnostic Activities on Participants

Participation did not only provide organisations with a better understanding of the specificities and histories of the neighbourhoods, it also encouraged participants to gain more knowledge of their living environment. In the four case studies, women<sup>65</sup> most often pointed to improved knowledge of their neighbourhood geography as the most useful part of the diagnostic and planning activities. The women's feelings of segregation in informal neighbourhoods reveal the gap between a segregated community and the rest of the city, as well as their isolation as individuals within a district.

<sup>63</sup> Intervention during the mixed gender workshop for Case Study 4, May 2017.

<sup>64</sup> This exercise was also carried out in Case Study 4.

<sup>65</sup> Intervention during the workshop discussion of women in Case Study 3, May 2017.

More broadly, the opportunity for inhabitants of disadvantaged neighbourhoods to meet in a 'neutral' environment has promoted new social relationships: "The possibility of making new acquaintances, where friendly relations will develop to the point where one can come to the aid of the other in the case of problems"<sup>66</sup>

When describing the participatory planning training process, leaders, public figures, and community members continually raised the themes of open discussion, democratisation of decisions, and the capacity to consider other points of view and synthesise them into a common vision or priorities.<sup>67</sup> As one participant explained, "The organisation required us to sit with the people, and explain [to] them, and to get them involved in projects. And we realised that – where the community participates in the project, it makes the project sustainable. This is not the project of a person, this is not the project of the association, it is the project of the community."<sup>68</sup> Similar testimonies were reported by participants in the 'talk space' programme implemented by FOKAL. In particular, it was highlighted that "each participant who shares their experiences and frustrations began a process of awareness which leads to an individual and collective emancipation" (FOKAL, 2013). Participants emphasised that their ability to exchange ideas and/or exercise their role as community leaders improved because "a kind of democracy is introduced to grassroots organisations"<sup>69</sup>

## Urban Planning

Following the diagnostic workshops, participants were included in formulating a strategy for the development of their neighbourhood. In most cases, the activities focused on two areas: the prioritisation of particular issues and identification of projects to complete in the short-term; and the design of a vision for neighbourhood development in the long-term.<sup>70</sup> Projects supported by UN-Habitat<sup>71</sup> integrated the priority projects identification phase into the diagnostic workshops. In other case studies, organisations sought to elaborate a more comprehensive urban development plan, following the institutional guidelines that were published in the meantime.<sup>72</sup>

**Table 6** highlights documents developed within the case studies to formulate the neighbourhood development plans, their objectives, and type of participation requested by the community.

In most case studies, the planning phase included essentially civil society members and the organisation; however, it also solicited occasional interaction with local authorities, such as representatives of the City Council and the city delegate or CASEC. Case Study 2 was the only example where the organisation formally established participatory urban planning as a space for exchange about urban issues between all actors active in the area, and of facilitating a process of consultation and dialogue between different actors involved in the same area.

**Table 6. Participation in the Planning Phase<sup>73</sup>**

Documents/ planning products	Objectives	Participation
Strategic Orientation Document	Establish priority problems to solve and a strategy for long-term neighbourhood development.	In two cases, participation was limited to members particularly committed to the community, who were invited to participate in exercises about prioritisation and about creating a long-term vision of the neighbourhood.
Action sheets and project sheets	Detail the implementation phase to ensure technical feasibility, sustainability, and support of the community.	Participation of members in defining the work was limited. Community members were responsible for validating the project just before it was initiated.

<sup>66</sup> Ibid

<sup>67</sup> Participants appreciated and considered other points of view, to integrate them into a common vision of priorities. In a participant's own words: "Everything that I learned, I put in practice. I have learned to appreciate the perspective of the other. I have done workshops myself using what I learned that I did not know before... Sometimes I was interacting with someone [and] this person said something I was not in agreement with ... but I say to him ok, it is your right. Because, in the workshops I learned [that] the perspective of the other is never wrong." (From intervention during mixed-gender workshop discussion for Case Study 3, May 2017.)

<sup>68</sup> Intervention during the mixed-gender workshop discussion for Case Study 2, May 2017.

<sup>69</sup> Ibid.

<sup>70</sup> The diagnostic and planning activities are aligned with the process of community action planning (CAP), in which community members produce descriptive maps of their neighbourhood (social mapping), identify and prioritise urban problems, and decide on a framework of actions (Habitat, 2014).

<sup>71</sup> Within the framework of the Haiti Reconstruction Fund, UN-Habitat has supported the development of 19 of the 34 planning projects listed.

<sup>72</sup> Definition of the urban development plan in CIAT *et al.* (2013).

<sup>73</sup> The data presented in the table are based on the planning documents of each case study and/or information collected from the organisations.

The main challenge of planning activities lies in the level of competence required for workshop participants to assess priorities beyond their individual views and needs. In the interest of transparency and democracy, “the debate requires an even level [of discourse]” (Flores and Jarrot, 2017). At this stage, the organisations used a set of approaches to bring participants to the same level of debate. For example, they provided information on the workshop’s theme, established a common vocabulary, and communicated outcomes of informational sessions held by national and international experts in each field (See Case Study 2).

The exercise of defining ‘the priorities of priorities’ was found by participants to be “easy to identify – it is the thing that makes everyone suffer at the same time”<sup>74</sup> However, this exercise proved limited when it came to its implementation phase, when the choice of the priority projects often generated conflict between different social groups, organisations, and local authorities.<sup>75</sup> Indeed, according to the testimony of one organisation, the times scheduled for the exercise were clearly not enough to generate informed and viable solutions to complex urban problems. It should be stated that in the case of the projects listed, “the participation practice [in the planning phase] is more adopted for its democratic and symbolic value than for its effective contribution to decision-making” (Thibault, 1995; Langlois, 2006). However, the gap between the time allocated to activities and the time taken to implement the participatory processes may have precipitated these actions. The lack of technical expertise, previous experience, and access to documents that can be used as guides by organisations can also limit creativity and innovation in these activities. This has sometimes limited participatory planning to the production of urban planning documents requested by rehabilitation projects.

In Case Study 2, participatory planning provided an exceptional opportunity for convening informal communities, wealthier homeowners, private sector representatives, and local and national authorities. It played a dual role: on the one hand legitimising residents as builders of the city, as engaged and creative spatial planning actors, and on the other – thanks to interventions by experts and local authorities – laying the ground for acceptance and respect of the principles of urban planning and safe construction.

According to one organisation,<sup>76</sup> planning exercises are a useful way of allowing a community to formalise a more informed, realistic, and strategic vision than the one it conveyed at the beginning of the process. Participants stated that the neighbourhood development plan represents “kijann zone la ap vini demen” (in English: “how the area will be in the future”<sup>77</sup>). Another respondent explained that “the neighbourhood development plan is a tool that we can adopt progressively for future generations, it represents the skeleton of the neighbourhood”. This is stated succinctly by a participant in the Christ-Roi discussion workshops, who said: “The vision has not changed, but it has evolved [...] I wish that all the projects that are described in the document will be built”.

In case studies 2, 3, and 4, the participatory planning phase sought to develop strategic development visions in line with actors’ aspirations. It proposed prospective, local development exercises with a timeframe of 10 or 20 years. This projection envisioned a series of interventions that exceeded the financial capacity of the ongoing project, and therefore could not be completed in that period.

The terminology used by organisations plays a critical role in the impact of this type of exercises. On the one hand they can conjure hopes and dreams that can help the objectives of the exercise; on the other, they can lead to profound misunderstandings.<sup>78</sup>

Despite efficient communication, the urban planning phase sometimes creates disproportionate expectations in the community. The biggest risk is to encourage an attitude of ‘wait-and-see’, rather than a proactive frame of mind.

## Relationships between Residents and Local Authorities

Planning workshops have multiple advantages: they allow citizens to have a higher stake in the development of their neighbourhoods, to witness the challenges of a collaborative decision-making process among different actors, and to identify themselves as part of a group with the same characteristics and a common vision. This has also proven advantageous for residents of slum neighbourhoods during exchanges with authorities.

---

<sup>74</sup> Intervention during the mixed-gender discussion workshop for Case Study 1, May 2017

<sup>75</sup> In these cases, it was the local authorities that helped organisations to manage the conflicts, thanks to the strong relationship they had developed during the participatory phase (case studies 3 and 4).

<sup>76</sup> Interview with Violaine Colonna D'Istria, member of the technical team of the organisation involved in case studies 1 and 2, May 2017.

<sup>77</sup> Intervention during the mixed-gender discussion workshop for Case Study 2, May 2017.

<sup>78</sup> In this respect, it is also interesting to note that the residents of Delmas 32, a municipality of Delmas, expressed disappointment that they did not see their neighbourhood transformed into a ‘mini Miami’. This, refers to the planning exercises that had fixed in their imagination the almost complete transformation of Delmas 32 through construction of multi-storey housing blocks.

However, as previously mentioned, relationships initiated with local authorities during the projects are generally weakened in time, due to the end of a programme or to changes in locally elected representatives. This is exacerbated by a lack of post-programme initiatives undertaken by residents or community platforms. Despite the planning exercises carried out in the case studies, the 'wait and see' attitude of community members interviewed indicates that the behaviour change created by the programme was not sufficient.

The involvement of civil society in the planning process ended at this stage. The organisations that pursued the validation of the urban planning document, as required by the Professional Guide for the Rehabilitation of Neighbourhoods (CIAT *et al.*, 2013), engaged in a bilateral process of consultation with local and national institutions. The document was then submitted to the validation committee led by CIAT. For some districts, representatives of the residents were invited as observers during the presentation to CIAT's technical committee.

## Participation in Implementation

In the Haitian context, particularly in disadvantaged neighbourhoods, community participation is mandated by the community itself, especially if the sites present technical challenges such as a lack of accessibility. Many examples of communities blocking construction sites have been reported, despite the planning exercises carried out in advance.

Participation in the implementation phase of development projects stimulates not only the local economy, but a strong sense of pride and ownership among community members, thus promoting the sustainability of the intervention. This local involvement occurred at different levels, once again depending on the choices and objectives of the organisation. Having worked on a similar scale in different parts of the metropolitan area, and within similar budgetary frameworks, organisations have adapted community participation to the scale and nature of the work to be carried out (see **Table 7**).<sup>79</sup>

**Table 7. Participation in the Implementation Phase**

Projects	Objectives	Participation
Implementation by the local private sector Large-scale development projects such as the restoration of roads, development of ravines, retaining walls, and water kiosks	Achieve priority interventions among those identified in the development plan for risk reduction and improvement of urban conditions (when the minimum amount of work exceeds approximately US\$20,000).	Members of the community, both women and men, participate in projects as skilled or unskilled workers; those with 'leadership' credentials collaborate with the enterprise to define the schedule for workers and secure the construction supplies.
Community-driven implementation. Attractiveness of small public areas or pedestrian corridors	Achieve priority interventions among those identified in the development plan, and increase the capacity of CBOs to carry out small- or medium-scale projects to reduce risks and to improve urban conditions.	Following a request for projects by the organisation, CBOs propose to carry out a project for the recovery and construction of road networks or public spaces. During the selection process, the CBOs present their project to a commission including local authorities. The selected CBOs manage the funds and implementation of the project, with technical assistance from the organisation.
Homeowner-driven construction Individual or collective residential buildings	Increase the safety of existing and future housing. Train community members in safe construction practices.	The funds and responsibility over the construction process are handed over to the house owner, who receives technical and administrative support for the implementation of works according to Haitian standards.

<sup>79</sup>The data presented in the table are based on the planning documents in the case studies and/or information collected from the organisations.

The main factor limiting community implementation of development projects is the level of complexity inherent in the work to be carried out. Indeed, a construction company has expertise that is largely inaccessible to members of the community. The challenge lies in the reasonable distribution of roles and responsibilities: project owner, project supervisor and/or operator, company, and community. This allows for more successful implementation and greater satisfaction as well as motivation among community actors.

In some case studies, organisations have offered construction training for women in order to improve their access to the work opportunities created by development projects. Community-driven interventions<sup>80</sup> have proven successful among residents in precarious neighbourhoods. This is due, in particular, to the self-management of funds allocated to CBOs, the interventions' ability to enhance CBO capacity, and the visibility that CBOs receive in their communities as a result. Such interventions support the objectives of the participatory process to strengthen grassroots organisations in project management. Even if the degree of training provided to CBOs and the organisations' objectives differed among case studies, this process provided all the organisations with increased acceptance in the intervention area, even in the most difficult ones.<sup>81</sup>

The homeowner-driven construction process<sup>82</sup> has been used for smaller residential building projects in order to construct or strengthen damaged structures. This process aims to develop the knowledge of the 'owner' related to safe construction practices, while providing him/her with technical and financial assistance to build a safe house. As an extension of this, specific improvements can be made in the urban fabric at a lower cost (e.g. broadening pedestrian roads,

improving drainage). The objective of this method is to ensure the sustainability of urban recovery through the reuse of safe construction practices, and with the application and respect of certain urban planning rules such as non-reoccupation of spaces released at the end of the project.

These processes, executed through community groups and by the homeowners themselves, aim to trigger participatory urban improvements. They then enable members of the community to use the technical knowledge gained during the programme as a means of improving and securing their own neighbourhoods.<sup>83</sup>

Involvement in the implementation of these projects has also strengthened the capacity of project management community members: "Before, if an organisation proposed to give us 200 dustbins, we would have taken them; now we would not. For a project of waste, it is necessary to have planning, structure, resources, and management".<sup>84</sup>

## Participation in Maintenance and Management

Both men and women described the maintenance and management of construction projects as a responsibility that the communities took on spontaneously. However, it was not possible to observe any significant community management of the structures that were built, as the observed maintenance only involved site cleanliness or minor repairs (e.g. changing basketball nets). Ensuring the cleanliness of the public works was a task primarily taken on by women, who introduced mechanisms for rotating responsibility.

---

<sup>80</sup>This is a process used in Haiti for the implementation of development interventions that meet priority needs identified by and with the community. The implementation, managed by one or more community associations in collaboration, is carried out with the technical and financial support of an external organisation. The funding allocated to these interventions is generally in the range of US\$5,000–10,000.

<sup>81</sup>In the difficult Grand Ravine neighbourhood, Concern Worldwide has used this process to conduct 30 urban regeneration projects in the framework of the PARAQ programme.

<sup>82</sup>Assisted Construction or Framed Construction has the technical name 'homeowner-driven construction'. It describes a process of building houses at a low cost based on the capacity of the contracting authority (former, current, or future owner of the property), and on their motivation to build their own house. The authority receives technical assistance during the stages of design, contractual arrangement, and implementation, with or without a subsidy. In Haiti, grants for this type of project are defined by the *Directives 001-3 relating to the implementation of development projects in their components housing and habitat*, which is published on the website of the UCLBP (<http://uclbp.gouv.ht/>).

<sup>83</sup>Interview with Rose-May Guignard, Senior Planner to the Technical Secretariat of CIAT, May 2017.

<sup>84</sup>Intervention during the mixed-gender workshop for Case Study 4, May 2017.

# Conclusions

The involvement of residents in urban planning plays a significant and innovative role in the framework for sustainable urban planning in Haiti. Participatory processes marked significant changes in the urban landscape and in citizen behaviour in slums, when residents committed themselves individually, or as representatives of a community platform, to improving the living spaces of their neighbourhoods.

The 2010 earthquake created an opportunity for international assistance grants to finance participatory action in post-crisis programmes. However, when these are developed over the short-term and without follow-up, they may not provide convincing results with regard to an institutional approach to long-term urban development in the Haitian capital.

There are opportunities for follow-up in the following areas:

- **Dissemination of urban planning documents** for the benefit of the population, organisations, and local authorities, using the urban planning documentation as reference for training on urban development topics.
- **Harmonisation of data** on slum neighbourhoods, collected by urban diagnostic activities.
- **Building on experiences** towards defining successful consolidated practices of participation in planning; defining their limitations; establishing more effective rules, tools, and methodologies; and consolidating them into policies. It is important for organisations involved in participatory planning to intervene in order to have realistic and well-defined scales, objectives, and topics.

Only projects on the 'neighbourhood' scale have been successfully carried out in post-crisis urban planning. The shift in the scale of participatory urban planning, from 'neighbourhood' to a wider geographical area such as the Port-au-Prince metropolitan area, is essential – and should not sacrifice citizen participation. For this change of scale to take place, lessons learned should be extrapolated from the experiences of implementation in order to complement reflections on local governance.

The research findings demonstrated that the activities that were carried out through the case studies for the purposes of participatory planning made it possible to identify and train a number of community actors from different socio-economic strata. It seems

appropriate for planning operations to rely on this wide social fabric, and to take into account their interests and motivations. These may be CBOs or platform representatives – but the process should not rely solely on the latter, in order to avoid bias. Participatory processes should be taken as an opportunity to strengthen networks between institutions, organisations, and citizens. In addition, according to the testimonies gathered at the neighbourhood level, where these participatory planning approaches were carried out, they enabled greater understanding of the role of institutions in urban development and management of basic services in informal areas.

The interviews highlight the opportunities created by 'open' planning processes – mechanisms that facilitate integration of the wider population including children, women, young people, and the elderly. In order to achieve genuine integration of the most marginalised segments of society, the strategies adopted by the case study projects should be seen as the minimum requirement: more should be done to adapt the participatory strategies to particular genders, ages, and economic circumstances in order to bring about a real change in practices. These strategies should include participation, training, and technical and financial support based on the specific needs of the population and the area.

One key issue to be tackled is the transfer of competencies between actors – in particular between non-governmental organisations and competent authorities. This transfer of competencies requires the engagement of state services with regard to including participatory approach in their procedures; the private sector must also have adequate capacity to integrate technical service with social components.

## Good Participation Practices

The role that residents can play has been well-established by Haiti's post-crisis and reconstruction interventions. This experience enabled humanitarians to develop their knowledge and practices in urban areas, and to develop new competencies that emerge from urban planning and urban management – in particular, the ability to:

- Identify, understand, and assign a role to each actor based on social, political, and institutional context; the goal being to design a system in which each person has a role to play.

- Understand actors' motivations in order to counteract possible deviations from the desired action, and support 'legitimate' motivations.
- Establish a participatory process from the initial emergency phase, aimed at training and supporting people in order to strengthen their participatory capacity during the reconstruction process.
- Identify participatory mechanisms to meet the needs of urban diagnostic and analysis, urban planning, and project implementation according to the different stages of the project.

## Strengthening the Legitimacy of Actors

The legitimacy given to residents of slum neighbourhoods as actors of urban development remains the greatest contribution of participatory urban planning projects. Thanks to this collaborative work involving local authorities and communities, urban rehabilitation projects have been implemented in previously inaccessible and/or forgotten locations. In accordance with the analysis of the case studies, in the following paragraphs participatory urban planning is considered across its stages in the project: its introduction, urban diagnostics planning, and implementation.

## Establishing Effective Communication

Once the organisation enters<sup>85</sup> the neighbourhood and the urban planning process begins, it becomes essential to begin providing information. First, it is necessary to identify the social structure of the community (identification of the interlocutor) through community leaders and registered CBOs. However, it is appropriate to broaden the scope by creating spaces to welcome spontaneous initiatives and applications – in particular, following the example offered by the experience of 'talk spaces'<sup>86</sup> in one of the case studies. The objective is to maintain a non-biased, collaborative relationship with residents of the intervention area from the outset. This will enable the wider community to gradually recognise<sup>87</sup> its role in defining the quality of its living environment and then to take over the process.

Throughout the planning process,<sup>88</sup> open and effective communication must be maintained. On the basis of the conclusions drawn from the case study projects (in particular case studies 2 and 4), there is a great deal of interest in the systematisation of communication<sup>89</sup> in multiple ways, notably through a weekly presence and public meetings. These steps help create benchmarks, and facilitate greater communication. All organisations created a branch at the intervention area, an office or an extension, which was accessible to all. Other examples include the establishment of a hotline or an ideas/suggestions box. Whatever the method, the availability of the organisation coupled with clear, stable, and known channels of communication, appear to be necessary elements in establishing a cooperative relationship with a community involved in urban recovery. Furthermore, for the residents, having the opportunity to meet in a neutral place can foster the establishment of new social relationships.

## The Importance of Diverse Actors

According to participants, their involvement in diagnostic and planning activities affected various aspects of their daily lives. In particular, it changed perceptions of their surroundings and created new social relationships, thus improving residents' relationships with their own neighbourhoods. In order to extend the reach of such positive impacts, planning workshop participation should be open to as many people as possible, including vulnerable groups. Organisations emphasised that the objectives and time investment involved must be clear to participants; the approach must also emphasise residents' rights and responsibilities, as opposed to organisations always responding to needs. In order to ease time and resource constraints, organisations issued calls for applications and then reduced the number of participants through open selection criteria. The selection criteria for 'representativeness' must be diversified, and may vary according to theme (see Case Study 2) in order to better capture the population's complex composition (i.e. young people, students, professionals, academics, conventional leaders) and garner richer responses to the same problem.

---

<sup>85</sup> "Enter a neighbourhood" is the wording used by participants to the discussion workshops of the case studies.

<sup>86</sup> Set up by FOKAL in Martissant since 2008, this is a space for discussions between the organisation and the community, where the objectives are both to inform and advise.

<sup>87</sup> Intervention during the mixed-gender discussion workshop for Case Study 4, May 2017: "We worked in partnership with the operator."

<sup>88</sup> Intervention during the mixed-gender discussion workshop at Christ-Roi, May 2017: "At each session, an organisation gave a report [...] in this way, even if we did not have the time to go, we could be ready for the next session."

<sup>89</sup> In Case Study 4, the organisation established communication systems to disseminate to the community the content developed during each planning workshop or weekly meeting. These systems are formalised in a Communication Handbook, which made it possible for the terminologies used and key messages to be consistent across the community for the duration of the project. This offered stability despite changes in the project team.

## The Importance of Training Stakeholders

The participation of civil society in the diagnostic phase achieved two objectives: it generated information to establish the urban profile of the neighbourhoods; and it developed inhabitants' awareness and understanding of their territory. The information required for the urban diagnostic was gathered through various consultative mechanisms including interactive mapping exercises, workshops, field visits, and exploratory walks.

The process of participation provided participants with a deeper knowledge of their territory. They testified to this being the most lasting impact of the activities they took part in. Through this work, channels of communication between residents of the intervention zones are organised in platforms or individually, and local institutions also appear to be strengthened.

Following the urban diagnostic workshops, participants were involved in defining the neighbourhood development strategy. In the majority of cases, the participatory process was realised through two exercises: the prioritisation of problems – specifically the identification of projects to be carried out in the short-term – and the formulation of a vision for long-term neighbourhood development.<sup>90</sup>

Organisations have put in place a series of instruments designed to create as much uniformity of knowledge as possible among participants in the planning workshops. These included the distribution of information on the daily theme, a common vocabulary, and information sessions held by national and international experts. The ability to discuss and the capacity to take decisions through a democratic process are topics that keep coming back in the words of leading figures and platform members when they describe their learning from the participatory planning process.

Despite the difficulties in creating an equal level of debate within the Haitian context, participatory planning in itself was an exceptional opportunity to convene informal communities, wealthier owners, private sector representatives, and local and national authorities. However, this relationship was shown to weaken as recovery programmes ended or new local officials were elected.

## Creating Spaces and Mechanisms for Participation

Few initiatives were undertaken by residents or community platforms after the recovery projects ended. In spite of the planning exercises carried out

as part of the case studies, there was insufficient behavioural change with regard to the objectives of creating and forming community members or local representative bodies that could be proactive in urban planning and development. There is a need to create more participatory spaces and mechanisms, as opposed to representative bodies.

## The Importance of a Framework for Urban Planning Objectives

Participatory planning processes demanded residents to provide their vision for the future neighbourhood development with a timeframe of 10 or 20 years. These exercises aimed to better understand actors' aspirations, which helped organisations define the strategic dimensions of development. The terminology used by local people to describe this exercise refers to dreams<sup>91</sup> and frustrations, revealing misunderstandings between communities, organisations, and local authorities. It has proven difficult to prevent high expectations during the early exercises for creating a vision. Organisations report that the time and resources available were not sufficient to generate informed and viable solutions to the complex problems that were raised. To prevent high expectations, according to Rose-May Guignard, "four basic elements are to be considered in the urban management schemes: water, sanitation, risk, and mobility. Often funds for everything else are not available. Everything else could be put in place with the collaboration of the communities (we can talk about participatory urbanism)".<sup>92</sup>

Additionally, the impact of participation is stronger towards the beginning and at the end of the planning process (i.e. the identification of problems and prioritisation of actions). The intermediate phase of definition, study and/or planning can technically be the responsibility of specialists, state services, or the private sector.

## Involving Community Actors in Carrying Out the Work

Participation in the implementation phase of development projects offers not only concrete support to the local people, but a strong sense of pride and ownership among community members, thus promoting the sustainability of the intervention. Involvement has also resulted in capacity-building: by using the technical knowledge gained during the programme, members of the community go on to further improve and secure their own neighbourhoods.

<sup>90</sup> Diagnostic and planning activities are aligned with the community action planning (CAP) process, in which community members produce social maps, identify and prioritise urban issues, and take decisions on a framework of actions to be undertaken. (UN-Habitat, 2014)

<sup>91</sup> "They sat down with us to talk about a vision (of the neighbourhood), they made us dream"; and, "I will die before I can see this", said a member of Morne Lazaar's platform with skepticism.

<sup>92</sup> Interview with Rose-May Guignard, Senior Urban Planner at the Technical Secretariat of CIAT, May 2017

# Project Files

<b>Case study 1</b>	<b>Participatory urban planning in Morne Lizarre and Nérette as part of the Débris 2 project and follow-up during the neighbourhood rehabilitation project 16/6.</b>
<p><i>The mandate entrusted to Emergency Architects Foundation (FAU) by the UN-Habitat includes the development of a Community Neighbourhood Restructuring Plan as part of the government Debris Management Project (Debris 2). In order to optimize the intervention in the neighbourhoods of Morne Lizarre, Morne Hercule and Nérette, close cooperation has developed between the Debris 2 and 16/6 projects to facilitate coordination between community planning and implementation of development projects. Project 16/6 was to initiate a neighbourhood rehabilitation process requiring the active participation of the community. The start of the participatory process has been launched with the formation of three community platforms, maintained active in the different parts of the programs (Debris 2 and then 16/6) to become the main link between the community, operators and local authorities.</i></p>	
<b>Characterization of neighbourhood and community of intervention</b>	
Targeted Neighbourhoods	Morne-Hercule, Morne Lazard, Nérette
Town	Pétion-ville
Characterization	The districts offer very urban landscapes with a central position. Located near the center of economic activities of Pétion-Ville, is experiencing a very strong development pressure.
Population	21600 hab. (5100 households) – 7477 hab. (Morne Lizarre), 5833 hab. (Nérette) 8291 hab. (Morne Hercules)
Area	40 ha (Morne Lizarre), 26 ha (Nérette), 32 ha (Morne Hercule)
Density	220 hab./ha (approximately)
Period of urbanization	Between 1980 and 1990 the urbanization process affected the majority of neighbourhoods.
Access to basic services	Neighbourhoods, despite their central position, suffer from a serious lack of access to basic services.
Social structure characteristics of the district(s)	Associative structures “committees” exist in neighbourhoods dedicating to provides better access to water and electricity in very limited areas.
Water	Water Committee in Morne Lizarre
electricity	The Electricity Committee in Bas Nérette (2009) facilitates access to electricity for 200 families. Its responsibilities are limited to the connection of households subscribing to EDH.
Waste	The association recognized under the OFAMOLA designation is in charge of pre-collection operations in Morne Lizarre
<b>Data on the participatory urban planning project</b>	
Urban Profile Documentation	“Urban Diagnostic and Development Projects”
	Issued by UN-Habitat in 2013 and funded by the Haiti Reconstruction Fund (HRF) in the context of the Debris 2 (Debris 2) project in the precarious neighbourhoods of Port-au-Prince to support the return of people affected by the earthquake to their homes. The field surveys and workshops with the platforms conducted by the Emergency Architects Foundation (FAU) were carried out between January-October 2012
Years of implementation of priority development projects	2013–2015 by UNOPS
Community Approach	Community planning in Morne Lazare, Nérette and Morne Hercule was conducted mainly with members of the community platforms of these areas. During the implementation of the Debris 2 project, involving emergency interventions such as the demolition of non-habitable homes and the removal of debris (UNDP), and then with Project 16/6, the platforms played the main role of connecting communities and operators. The objective of creating a community infrastructure capable of supporting the future development of neighbourhoods was pursued by strengthening the capacities of the platforms in terms of project management and design.

<b>Case study 1</b>	<b>Participatory urban planning in Morne Lizarre and Nérette as part of the Débris 2 project and follow-up during the neighbourhood rehabilitation project 16/6.</b>
Diagnostic and planning topics	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Natural hazards;</li> <li>• Accessibility and travel;</li> <li>• Urban networks and services;</li> <li>• Equipment and services to the population;</li> <li>• Public space;</li> <li>• Commercial and craft activities;</li> <li>• Housing.</li> </ul>
<b>Analysis of the participatory process</b>	
Key Elements of the Participatory Methodology	<p><b>Intensive work with members of the community platforms.</b> Consistent with the Debris 2 and 16/6 project approaches, community platforms played a key role in the urban planning process. The platforms that were trained during the Debris 2 project received their legal recognition from the Town Hall of Pétiion-Ville. Members of each platform participated actively in more than 20 meetings with planners to develop diagnostic documents and identify development projects. During the weekly meetings, urban planners and members of the platforms analyzed and developed the themes of the urban diagnostic, and then defined and prioritized development projects. All this work has been presented by the members of platforms to their community for consultation and validation of the projects to be prioritised.</p> <p><b>The planning document: a clear and synthetic tool.</b> The report document is broken down by theme (see above) and each topic contains the diagnostic elements identified, the challenges and the proposed development projects. The “response” context to earthquake situations seems to have shaped the definition of the approach to planning: the document includes very operational indications on “soft” components for strengthening or creating community structures related to the neighbourhood rehabilitation, elements of guidance for UNOPS’ construction and repair project and recommendations for the use of debris.</p>
Participation Activities	1 cartography workshop, 10 workshops with 3 platforms (6 thematic workshops, 4 workshops with specific actors of neighbourhoods – women, elderly people, young people, education and health sector, actors of the local economy), 3 workshops validation of results.
Resources (Team)	1 project manager, 1 town planner by district, 2 facilitators, 5 interviewers
<b>Which members of the community participated?</b>	
Number of persons	Morne Lizarre Community Platform: 22 members, Nérette Community Platform: 20 members, Morne Hercule Community Platform: 23 members.
Diversity	<p>Morne Lizarre: Women: 32% of participants.</p> <p>Nérette: Women: 30% of participants.</p> <p>Morne Hercule: Women 39% of participants.</p>
<b>Representativeness</b>	<p>The representativeness of the participatory process depends on the composition of the platforms; The following groups were targeted since the inception phase: notable members, camp representatives, youth groups, persons with disabilities, religious groups, grassroots organisations /local NGOs, representatives from the education sector, representatives from the health sector, women’s organisations.</p> <p>Four thematic workshops were developed bringing together, in addition to the members of the platforms, specific actors from the education and health sectors, the local economy, young people and some of the most vulnerable groups such as women.</p>
<b>References</b>	
	For this case study, UN-Habitat represents the source of the research data. In addition, the interview with a professional who worked (as an urban planner) on the project and discussion workshops with members of the Morne Lizarre and Nérette community platforms, provided additional information to the research data.

Case Study 2	Participatory urban planning in Haut-Turgeau and Debussy as part of the urban rehabilitation project “Menm Katye, Lòt Vizaj”
<p><i>Following the earthquake of 2010, the population of Haut-Turgeau was required to take part twice in a participatory process related to its living environment. In 2012, the ONG GOAL received by UN-Habitat the mandate to accompany the community platform of the zone in the development of a neighbourhood profile as part of the Débris 2 project. In 2013, GOAL, as leader of the PARAQ project in the zone, on the base of the results of the previous urban diagnostic, conducted participatory consultations leading to the definition of an urban development plan and of the priority projects to be carried out in the area. The observations in this case study focus on this latest planning process.</i></p>	
<p><b>Characterization of neighbourhood and community of intervention</b></p>	
Targeted Neighbourhoods	Haut-Turgeau (Bas-Turgeau, Bas-Manrèse, City of Canada, La Grotte, Cité Georges, Cité Lucien, Cité Gabriel), Debussy
Town	Port au Prince
Characterization	The districts are located on the slopes of Morne l’Hôpital. Located in the heart of Haut Turgeau, the source of Turgeau is a reference point in the community. Neighbourhoods present heterogeneous urban fabrics and social levels. Bas-Turgeau benefits of a privileged situation in terms of better road accessibility and ease of access to basic services.
Population	21,400 inhabitants.
Area	190 ha
Density	more than 70 buildings / ha
Period of urbanization	The process of urbanization was initiated between 1970 and 1990 but following the earthquake of 2010 the phenomenon is experiencing a strong accentuation.
Characterization of the social structure of the neighbourhood	Haut-Turgeau: 1 platform, 25 OCBs, Debussy: 1 platform, 7 OCBs
Water	The Water Committee at Cité Canada KJOPSK (Water Management Committee for Cité Canada) managed two DINEPA waterkiosks at the moment of the diagnostic
Electricity	Electricity Committee at Cité Gabriel, Cité Canada and Cité Georges
Waste	Social Movement for Development (MSD) in Cité Georges
<p><b>Data related to the participatory urban planning project</b></p>	
Urban Profile Documentation	Urban Diagnostic and Planning Projects
	Published by UN-Habitat in 2013, funded by the Haiti Reconstruction Fund (HRF) under the project Debris management in the precarious neighbourhoods of Port-au-Prince in support of the returning movement of populations affected by the earthquake to their homes.
Urban Development Plan	Menm Katye, Lòt Vizaj, Urban Development Plan of the districts of Haut-Turgeau and Debussy
	Published in December 2015 by Goal Haiti, the workshops for the preparation of the urban development plan were held between December 2014 and February 2015.
Years of implementation of priority development projects	2016–2017 by GOAL
Community Approach	GOAL’s interventions in the neighbourhoods go back to 2010, carrying out post-earthquake emergency operations in IDP camps in the area. Through meetings with the CBOs, with the “most active” people, the social structure of the neighbourhood was reconstituted. This is also made possible by continuous communication with the Haut-Turgeau and Debussy community platforms. The 2015 urban development plan takes into account the information provided by the two previous diagnostics. The urban planning process is designed by GOAL to play a role of “relay” in all the actions of the project. The planning activities were carried out on the basis of a process that was as open as possible to the targeted population, which encouraged the creation of different forms and opportunities for exchanges between the operator and members of the community in wider aspects. At the neighbourhood level, GOAL acted as a facilitator during the planning, implementation and monitoring phases. With the multiplication of mechanisms for exchange and information, the participatory process becomes a “means of social structuring” and guides the activities of capacity building. According to the testimonies of community members: “the content of the training represents a shared knowledge and a basis for the collective work”.

Case Study 2	Participatory urban planning in Haut-Turgeau and Debussy as part of the urban rehabilitation project “Menm Katye, Lòt Vizaj”
Diagnostic and planning topics	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Roads, mobility and travel;</li> <li>• Environment and risk management;</li> <li>• Housing, living conditions and land;</li> <li>• Access to basic services;</li> <li>• Facilities, public space and community life;</li> <li>• Activities and socio-economic context.</li> </ul>
Information support survey	<p>The enumerative survey addressed to each household with information about buildings, housing, family and the demography of the area.</p> <p>Comprehensive field surveys were carried out on the following themes: roads, public spaces, urban lighting, economic activities, and equipment.</p> <p>Sectoral study analyzing the natural threats to which neighbourhoods are exposed</p>
Analysis of the participatory process	
Elements of participatory methodology	<p>A process as “open as possible” supported by several information, consultation and dialogue mechanisms. The process of participation revolves around three main areas of exchange:</p> <p>A weekly permanence (information, consultation);</p> <p>Participatory reflection and workshops (Phase 1 – Diagnostic, Phase 2 – Planning): Vision of the neighbourhood in 20 years, hierarchy of interventions);</p> <p>Neighbourhood meetings to share and discuss the draft of the urban development plan.</p> <p>The CBOs hold a copy of the final document. GOAL is currently translating the final document into Creole.</p>
	<p>The population, experts and Haitian institutions are grouped around the same table. The workshops aim to initiate a dialogue between the various actors who should lead the development of the zone’s development strategy on a collective basis. The process of consultation and decision-making revolves around two phases:</p> <p>Phase 1: thematic workshops for discussion with participation of local, national authorities, neighbourhood residents and experts in the field according to the theme of the workshop. For each theme, two non-consecutive workshop days in the same week, dedicated to 6 workshops associated with a SWOT analysis per theme. “Thematic Vocabulary” shared at the beginning of each workshop.</p> <p>Phase 2: 2 synthesis workshops to collectively develop a long-term vision of the territory and to define the priority interventions to be carried out.</p>
Resources (Team)	1 project coordinator, 1 project manager, 2 urban planners, 1 urban planning assistant, 1 GIS expert, 4 facilitators, 20 surveyors
Which members of the community participated?	
Number of persons	Of the 180 guests, 120 people from the community participated in the workshops.
Diversity	The age of those workshops attendees varies between 19 and 81 years. The percentage of women is estimated at 42% of participants.
Representativeness	<p>In order to ensure representativeness in the process of selecting the members of the community to be invited to the workshops, the operator has defined criteria for representativeness of different social groups for each theme. The number of inhabitants invited to each workshop for each zone was then defined in order to respect proportionality to the total population of the area (this resulted in about 20–25 inhabitants per zone).</p> <p>For the workshops dealing with the definition of the strategic axes and the prioritisation of projects, the community representatives were selected according to their level of commitment and participation in the previous phase.</p>
References	
	<p>For this case study, the research data comes from Goal Haiti. They were supplemented by interviews with professionals part of (an urban planner and a manager) the project team. Additional data are drawn from discussion workshops with community members who participated in the participatory planning process and through an interview with a member of the OCB (NOVIC) that built a public space in Haut-Turgeau.</p>

Case study 3	Participatory urban planning in Carrefour as part of the urban rehabilitation project "Katye nou pi be l"
<i>In the framework of the neighbourhood redevelopment project "Katye nou pi bèl " (PARAQ) carried out by CARE Haiti in collaboration with the Municipality of Carrefour and Cordaid, the participatory urban diagnostic and planning activities leading to the definition of an urban development plan for the neighborhoods of Aztek, Sapotille and La Grenade at Carrefour was entrusted to the Emergency Architects Foundation during the period 2012–2013.</i>	
<b>Characterization of neighbourhood and community of intervention</b>	
Neighbourhood / s touched	Aztek, Grenada, Sapotille and Ti-Sous
Commune	Carrefour
Characterization	The districts are located at the edge of the metropolitan area, littering the main access road south. It is an area with rural vocation that have undergone a gradual process of informal urbanization by its inhabitants. It is characterized by poorly accessible roads and corridors.
Population	32000 hab.
Building Density	6000 construction / km <sup>2</sup> , majority of one-story buildings
<b>Period of urbanization</b>	Beginning in 1986
Access to basic services	Basic services are almost non-existent in the three zones.
Water	Very limited access to water (existence of a Water Committee of Bertin).
Electricity	Connection to electricity grid was effective from 2005 on the initiative of the inhabitants of the district grouped into committees
Waste	-
<b>Data on the participatory urban planning project</b>	
Urban Profile Documentation	Participatory urban diagnostic of Aztek, Sapotille and Grenada.
	July – November 2013
Urban Development plan	Urban Development Dcheme: Ti-Sous, Grenada, Sapotille and Aztek.
	November 2013 – January 2014
Years of implementation of priority development projects	Over 2014 – 2017 period and implemented by CARE
Community Approach	<p>The operator's goal was to maximize the educational opportunities of community participation exercises during the neighbourhood diagnostic and planning. Through an open process aimed at including a considerable number of community members and social groups ( with a special focus on women), the operator offered the communities various opportunities for exchange, awareness-raising and training in order to stimulate the reflection of participants. Thus, participatory planning had an educational impact: not only did the inhabitants contribute to building the profile of the neighbourhood but also changed their perception of their living environments and thus improve their living conditions.</p> <p>The presence of the Carrefour City Council in the project partnership, seems to have eased the process of inclusion of the authorities in planning: Carrefour ATL agents regularly took part in the meetings and participate in the definition of the working strategy with the operator.</p>
Priority topics for planning	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Environment / Natural Hazards / Ravine / Urban Agriculture</li> <li>• Roads / Mobility / Transport / Street Lighting / Public Spaces</li> <li>• Habitat / Urban services (water, electricity, waste, sanitation)</li> <li>• Facilities: health, education, culture, sport, worship</li> <li>• Economy (trade, crafts, industry, services)</li> </ul>
Survey information support to Participatory process	In 1.5 months, the operator has surveyed approximately 4,000 households. Field checks.

<b>Case study 3</b>	<b>Participatory urban planning in Carrefour as part of the urban rehabilitation project "Katy nou pi be l"</b>
<b>Analysis of the participatory process</b>	
Key elements of the methodology	<p><b>Launch of open participation in the form of a call for candidates.</b> The information process calling for candidates to participate in the diagnostic and planning workshops was conducted through informal meetings with community leaders and through the posting of notices and leaflets. The selection aimed at people interested in neighbourhood development without reserving participation to CBO members. At the time of registration, participants were asked to reflect on the time and commitment they were willing to voluntarily dedicate to the activities.</p> <p><b>Interactive activities focused solely on women and children.</b> The operator placed the reflections of this category at the heart of the analysis relating to public security and in relation to access to services in the area. For the first theme, a march of 1.5 km was carried out gathering 10 women from the neighbourhoods. On their journey, the description of the problems of women's movements reveals the physical and perceived safety situations (of rape and theft) and the practices – and limits – that women develop to mitigate the risks of insecurity during walking. A concluding workshop brought women to exchange and share their aspirations for their neighbourhood. A similar technique has been adopted to highlight the practices of children in public spaces: the operator this time has observed children in the course of leisure, en route to school or to research water.</p>
Main elements of the methodology	Participation represents an important pillar in the orientations of the scheme and in defining the characteristics of the projects to be developed. The same members of the community participated to the diagnostic workshops and in the planning workshops that followed. The operator in this way was able to focus on the relational dynamics established between the actors and on the capabilities developed during the diagnostic phase. The operator has aimed at maximizing the possibilities of reflection, through interactive working techniques to stir up the motivation of the participants in order to facilitate the process of appropriation of the results. In addition, the operator has sensitized participants on the crucial actions to be undertaken to improve their living environment. These techniques encouraged the participants to reflect while projecting the future of the neighbourhood.
Participation Activities	30 workshops in total, 6 thematic groups of 20 people: each participates in 2 diagnostic workshops, 1 diagnostic validation, 2 planning workshops, 1 validation of the development plan. (Workshops carried out between 22 July and 8 October 2013).
Resources (Team)	1 urban planner, 1 urban planning assistant (documentation writing), 1 community mobilization team, 1 hydrologist specialist, 1 cartographer.
<b>Which members of the community participated?</b>	
Number of persons	150 adults (100 workshops, 50 in additional activities dedicated to specific groups century)
Diversity	Women: 30% of participants
representativeness	Out of a total of 650 spontaneous applications received, 100 participants were selected according to criteria of representativeness of the zones and social groups. In addition to the thematic workshops conducted, other workshops / specific activities involving women, young people, children and people with reduced mobility were organized to multiply the voices of the communities.
<b>References</b>	
	For this case study, the research data were collected from interviews with professionals who provided services (an urban planner and a community agent) to the project. Additional data were derived from discussion workshops with community members who participated in the participatory planning process.

Case Study 4	Participatory urban planning for Christ-Roi in the context of the urban rehabilitation project “Pwoje pou remanbre Kriswa”
<i>Developed by Solidarités International, participatory urban planning for Christ-Roi was carried out in two distinct phases. The first stage of defining the urban profile of the neighbourhood was carried out in 2012. The second phase specifically concerned the definition of a planning scheme and the preparation of the implementation of priority projects to be carried out under the program PARAQ, financed by the EU. The project combines several components related to the improvement of the living environment of the population in the neighbourhood.</i>	
<b>Characterization of neighbourhood and community of intervention</b>	
Neighbourhood / s touched	Christ-Roi (Christ-Roi 1, Christ-Roi 2, Christ-Roi Trou Sable, Christ-Roi – Lalue)
Commune	Port-au-Prince
Characterization	Located in the center of the metropolitan area of Port-au-Prince, on the border between two communes: Delmas and Port-au-Prince.
Population	About. 20000 hab. (IHSI, 2009)
Area	80 ha (approximately)
Density	Between 300 persons / ha and 400 persons / ha, with peaks at 600 persons / ha
Period of urbanization	Since 1950 the population had already settled, but the process of urbanisation began to increase in 1980. From 1986 to 1991, a process of densification changed the urban fabric of the neighborhood.
Access to basic services	The water and electricity are accessible, but the area has a very low level of sanitation. The lack of an effective waste management plan affects the residents’ living environment.
Characterization of the social structure of the neighbourhood	Prior to 2010, three (3) CBOs were present in the neighbourhood. In 2012, approximately thirty (30) OCBs were identified.
Water services access	Water Committee at Trou Sable which manages four (4) water kiosks
Services electricity access	-
Waste management	Multiple initiatives, initiated by Catholic Relief Services after the earthquake.
<b>Data on the participatory urban planning project</b>	
Urban Profile Documentation	Christ-Roi, a community portrait of a neighbourhood of Port-au-Prince.
	Funded by DG Humanitarian Aid and Civil Protection (ECHO), the project was implemented by Solidarités International in close collaboration with the Municipality of Port-au-Prince, finalized in 2012.
Urban Development plan	Christ-Roi: a development plan for a neighbourhood easier to access, healthier and more attractive.
	Financed under the PARAQ program “Pwoje pou remanbre Kriswa”, issued in 2013 by the Solidarités International and Emergency Architects Foundation.
Years of implementation of priority development projects	From 2013 to 2017, the project was carried out jointly by Solidarités International and Global Communities
Community Approach	The interventions of Solidarités International in the zone date from the 2010 earthquake. The diagnostic is based both on the inhabitants perceptions and on data derived from household surveys, fiel assessments and the sector studies. The urban diagnostic and development plan are structured around the same themes and were discussed with the same members of the population (the urban planning scheme added more voices to the conversation). If during the diagnostic and planning phases operators opted for an “open” approach, during the implementation phase the operator, in close collaboration with the Port-au-Prince town hall, has chosen to work directly with the population and the notables of the specific areas concerned by the interventions. At the same time, Solidarités International (SI) has developed a communication manual as a methodical tool for conveying information to the community.
Priority planning themes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The boundaries of the neighbourhood;</li> <li>• Cleanliness of the environment;</li> <li>• Functionality and accessibility;</li> <li>• Spaces of sociability;</li> <li>• Economic dynamics;</li> <li>• Housing.</li> </ul>

<b>Case Study 4</b>	<b>Participatory urban planning for Christ-Roi in the context of the urban rehabilitation project “Pwoje pou remanbre Kriswa”</b>
Participatory process information support survey	Three-day Household Survey: sample of 475 households
<b>Analysis of the participatory process</b>	
Main elements of the methodology	<p>Urban Profile:</p> <p>The logic of using and carrying a slogan and a festive wandering on the following content: “An’n brase lide pou chanje figi katye’n” Slogan for a festive wandering for the launch of the diagnostic (100 people registered in the workshops in response to this initiative).</p> <p>Conducting consultations in the form of workshops, 5 participatory mapping workshops (Mental map – Kevin Lynch, quality and defects exercise), project prioritization activities. One (1) day of mental mapping exercises featuring themes for the following days. The group was split into two, and the following sessions were organized in two half-days. Participants gathered around a working table of six to ten people, each facilitated by a facilitator with the task of transcribing the content of the discussions and helping to produce the thematic maps. Each table worked on a background map superimposed by a sheet of tracing paper to collect comments and drawings from participants. At the end of the session, the groups shared the results of their work with all the participants.</p>
Communication	To facilitate communication, a manual has been developed for coherent and effective communication.
Participation Activities	Urban profile: 1 day of mental mapping exercises, 5 participatory mapping workshops
	Development plan: 30 workshops, participants divided into six thematic groups
Resources (Team)	Community mobilization team (Solidarités International): 4 mobilizers, 1 manager. Technical team of the operator for the urban development plan : 1 urban planner, 1 engineer, 1 cartographer, 1 coordinator.
Duration of the process	February 2013 – November 2013 (10 months)
<b>Which members of the community participated?</b>	
Number of persons	Urban profile: 56 adults, 12 children
	Urban Development Plan: 138 people (43 women)
Diversity	Urban Profile: Persons aged 8–52 years, Women: 56% of participants.
<b>References</b>	
	For this case study, the research data were collected from interviews with professionals who provided services (a project manager and a community agent) to the project. Additional data were derived from discussion workshops with community members who participated in the participatory planning process.

# Appendices

## Participatory urban Planning Projects executed between 2010 and 2016 ( Source: UN-Habitat and authors)

#	Neighbourhood	Operator	Funding
1	Ti Sous	CORDAID / FAU	EU
2	Martissant	AFD / GRET	AFD
3	Grand Ravine	Concern / AfH	EU
4	Fort-Mercredi	UN-Habitat / FAU	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
5	Cité 9	UN-Habitat / FAU	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
6	Descayettes	UN-Habitat / FAU	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
7	Savane-Pistaches	UN-Habitat / FAU	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
8	Sanatorium	UN-Habitat / FAU	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
9	Saieh	UN-Habitat / FAU	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
10	Baillergeau	AFD / GRET	AFD
11	Campêche	We-SPORA	Croix Rouge Americaine
12	Deprez	Croix Rouge Americaine	Croix Rouge Americaine
13	TiSavan	UN-Habitat / FAU	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
14	Haut Turgeau	UN-Habitat / GOAL	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
15	Bois Patate	UN-Habitat / GOAL	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
16	Jean-Baptiste	UN-Habitat / GOAL	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
17	Morne Ebo	UN-Habitat / GOAL	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
18	Villa Rosa	UN-Habitat /CORDAID/ AfH	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
19	Sainte Marie	UN-Habitat /CORDAID/ AfH	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
20	Morne Lazarre	UN-Habitat / FAU	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
21	Nerette	UN-Habitat / FAU	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
22	Morne Hercule	UN-Habitat / FAU	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
23	Bristou-Bobin	UN-Habitat / FAU	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
24	Fort National	UN-Habitat	Haiti Reconstruction Fund
25	Ravine pintade	Global Communities (ex. CHF)	World Bank (PREKAD)
26	Christ Roi	Solidarités International/FAU	EU
27	Nazon	Global Communities (ex. CHF)	World Bank (PREKAD)
28	Delmas 30	IFRC	World Bank (PREKAD)
29	Delmas 32	SODADE	World Bank (PRODEPUR)
30	Delmas 9 (7-13)	Croix Rouge Francaise	EU
31	Delmas 19	Croix Rouge Brittanique	World Bank (PREKAD)
32	Simon Pele	HfH / AfH	World Bank (PRODEPUR)
33	Desprez	GRET	EU
34	Carrefour-Feuilles	We-SPORA-LGL	BMPAD

# References

## Selected Bibliography

- Barrau E. et Enoux C. (2010). Vers l'institutionnalisation d'une délégation communautaire ? dans *Revue Tiers Monde* n°203 (3/2010), France, p. 123 à 140.
- Bazzaco et Sepúlveda, (2010). Barrio Trabajando. Metodología de evaluación de la participación ciudadana en proyectos de mejoramiento barrial, México.
- Brussels Institute for the management of the Environment (2013). *Vademecum noise urban road. Citizen participation in the success of development projects*, Vol I, p. 9.
- CIAT, MTPTC, UCLBP (2013). *Professional Guide, Rehabilitation of Neighbourhoods, Stages of Urban Planning, Working Document Version 1.0.*
- Choguill, M. (1996). A Ladder of Community Participation for Underdeveloped Countries, dans *HABITATINTL*. Vol. 20, No. 3, pp. 431–444.
- Commission Economique pour l'Amérique Latine et les Caraïbes (2005). *Pauvreté et stratégies de survie dans les quartiers précaires de l'Aire Métropolitaine de Port-au-Prince.*
- Conseil National des Villes (2011). « La démocratie locale et la participation des habitants ». Avis adopté par le Bureau du CNV du 19 janvier 2012 dans le cadre de la saisine ministérielle du 17 juin 2010, p. 6.
- Corbet, A. (2012). *Rapport de recherche : Approche communautaire en Haïti : décryptage de la notion de « communautés » et recommandations*, Groupe U.R.D.
- Couet, L. et al. (2013). *L'espace public au cœur de la reconstruction – exemple de Martissant à Port-au-Prince, Haïti.*
- Cunningham, J. V. (1972). « Citizen Participation in Public Affairs », *Public Administration Review*, vol. 32, no spécial, p. 589–602.
- Deprez, S. et Labattut, E. (2011). *La reconstruction de Port-au-Prince. Analyses et réflexions sur les stratégies d'interventions en milieu urbain (non publié).*
- Emergency Group Rehabilitation Development (2013). *Evaluation of the Support Programme for the Reconstruction of Housing and Neighbourhoods. Combined programme with UN-Habitat, UNDP, UNFPA and with IOM in support of Haitian institutions UCLBP, MPCE, MICT, 10 Municipalities, IHSI, and CNIIGS. Synthesis Report, March 2013*
- Emergency Group Rehabilitation Development (2012). *Planning participatory work in urban and rural areas (online: <http://www.urd.org/La-participatory-planning>)*
- Flores, P. et Jarrot, S. (2016). *La participation citoyenne comme outil de la gouvernance urbaine. Haïti Perspectives, Cahier thématique vol 5: La participation citoyenne, Haïti (publié aussi en ligne : <http://www.haiti-perspectives.com/pdf/5.3.pdf>).*
- FOKAL (2013). *Le Parc et le quartier de Martissant – Espaces de Parole 2008–2012, Port-au-Prince.*
- García, L. (2010) *Un estudio del barrio y la cultura. Conference: La construcción de indicadores del desarrollo cultural comunitario, Ciudad de México.*
- Goulet (2004). *At the national level, 4.5 million people (74.4 per cent of the urban population) in Haiti live in precarious neighbourhoods. Source: UN (2014) (<https://data.un.org>)*
- Global Facility for Disaster Reduction and Recovery (2016). *What did we learn? The Shelter Response and Housing Recovery in the First Two Years after the 2010 Haiti Earthquake, The World Bank.*
- Graizbord, B. (1999). *Planeación urbana, participación ciudadana y cambio social, Economía, Sociedad y Territorio, Janvier 1999, pp. 149–161, El Colegio Mexiquense, A.C., Toluca, México.*
- Groupe Urgence Réhabilitation Développement (2012). *Manuel de la participation à l'usage des acteurs humanitaires, Groupe U.R.D (en ligne : [www.urd.org/article/le-manuel-de-la-participation](http://www.urd.org/article/le-manuel-de-la-participation)).*
- Groupe Urgence Réhabilitation Développement (2012). *La planification participative en milieu urbain et rural, Groupe U.R.D (en ligne: <http://www.urd.org/La-planification-participative-en>).*

- Groupe Urgence Réhabilitation Développement (2013). Evaluation du Programme d'Appui à la Reconstruction du Logement et des Quartiers. Programme conjoint entre agences onusiennes ONU-Habitat, PNUD, FNUAP et avec OIM en appui aux institutions haïtiennes: UCLBP, MPCE, MICT, 10 Municipalités, IHSI, CNIGS. Rapport de synthèse;
- Habitat for Humanity (2013) National Housing Policy. the Framework Document
- Hardina, D. (2008). « Citizen Participation », dans T. Mizrahi et L. E. Davis, Encyclopedia of Social Work, National Association of Social Workers and Oxford University Press.
- IHSI (2015). Population totale, population de 18 ans et plus, ménages et densités estimés en 2015.
- IHSI, IRD, DIAL, NOPOOR, ANR, (2014). L'évolution des conditions de vie en Haïti entre 2007 et 2012. La réplique sociale du séisme, Paris, Port-au-Prince.
- Institut Bruxellois pour la gestion de l'environnement (2013). « Vadémécum du bruit routier urbain. La participation citoyenne dans la réussite des projets d'aménagement », vol I, p. 9.
- International Rescue Committee (2017) Urban context analysis toolkit. Guidance note for humanitarian practitioners. IIED, London.
- Langlois, A. M. (2006). La participation citoyenne au cœur de la responsabilité populationnelle, Québec, Gouvernement du Québec, p. 25.
- Leguenic, M. (2001). L'approche participative. Fondements et principes théoriques : Application à l'action humanitaire. Groupe U.R.D., p. 1.
- Lhérisson, G. (2015). Principes, règlements & outils opérationnels de la législation haïtienne sur le développement urbain, Port-au-Prince.
- Lizarralde, G. (2017). Is public participation really the key to success for urban projects and initiatives aimed at disaster risk reduction? oddebates.com, Vulnerability, Resilience, and Post-Disaster Reconstruction International Debates, Organized by Œuvre-durable and i-Rec (en ligne, Avril 2017).
- Lombart, M., Pierrat, K. et Redon, M. (2014). Port-au-Prince : un « projectorat » haïtien ou l'urbanisme de projets humanitaires en question, vol. 1 Modes de gouvernement en Haïti après le séisme de 2010, Cahiers des Amériques Latines (publié en ligne).
- López, C. (2010). « L'aménagement participatif. Un nouvel objet d'étude », L'Ordinaire des Amériques [En ligne], 214 | 2010, mis en ligne le 23 février 2014.
- Lynch, K. (1960). The Image of the City. The MIT Press.
- Morales, R. (2007). Participación ciudadana en la formulación de políticas públicas locales, el caso del distrito VI del Municipio de Managua en Rev. Est. de Políticas Públicas, p.p. 129–151, Santiago de Chile.
- National League of Cities. (2011). "The local democracy and the participation of inhabitants". Opinion adopted by the Office of the CNV of 19 January 2012 in the framework of the ministerial referral of 17 June 2010, p. 6.
- Parker E. and Maynard V. (2015). Humanitarian response to urban crises: a review of area-based approaches, IIED Working Paper. IIED, London.
- Rainhorn, J.D. (2012). Haïti, réinventer l'avenir, Éditions de la Maison des sciences de l'homme, Paris.
- Rosales-Montano, S. (2009). El análisis y la gestión urbana participativa, herramientas de gobernabilidad local democrática. Elementos metodológicos para acompañar la decisión pública concertada, la intervención espacial sostenible, y el reforzamiento de las competencias locales, Apoyo Urbano.
- UN-Habitat (2014). A practical guide to designing, planning and executing citywide slum upgrading programmes (publié en ligne).
- UN-Habitat (2012) Urban diagnostic Pétiön-Ville.
- UN-Habitat, Guide la planification communautaire, version draft (non publiée).
- UN-HABITAT (2007). State of World's Cities Report, 2006–2007.
- UN-Habitat, Community Planning Guide, draft (forthcoming).
- United Nations Human Settlements Programme (2010). Strategic Citywide Spatial Planning: A situational analysis of metropolitan Port-au-Prince, Haïti.
- UN-HABITAT (2008). State of World's Cities Report, 2006–2007
- UNDP-Haiti (2017). Projet 16 quartiers, 6 camps (16/6)
- Universalia (2015). External Evaluation of the Haiti Reconstruction Fund (en ligne).
- Ziccardi, A. (2013). Espacio público y nuevas formas de participación ciudadana. El caso del Programa Comunitario de Mejoramiento de Barrios de la Ciudad de México en Carajillo de la Ciudad, publication digital del Programa en Gestión de la Ciudad.

## Haitian Operational Directives and National Policies

CIAT (2013). Lois et règlements, lois d'urbanisme, Synthèse des Textes Législatifs et Règlementaires de l'Urbanisme en Vigueur en Haïti.

CIAT, MTPTC, UCLBP (2013). Guide du professionnel, Réhabilitation de quartiers, Les étapes de la planification urbaine, document de travail version 1.0.

Groupe IBI, DAA (2012). Guide de l'urbanisme simplifié et illustré. Rapport d'étape – Cahier 1 / 2.

MPCE (2015). Guide méthodologique. Réduction des risques naturels en zone urbaine en Haïti. Mieux prendre en compte le risque dans l'urbanisation et l'aménagement du territoire.

MTPTC (2012). Code National du bâtiment d'Haïti, Haïti.

UCLBP (2013). Politique Nationale du Logement et de l'Habitat, Document cadre, Haïti.

UCLBP (2015). Directives 001-3 relatives à la mise en œuvre des projets d'aménagement dans leurs volets logement et habitat (publié en ligne).

United Nations Human Settlements Programme (2010) Strategic Citywide Spatial Planning: A situational analysis of metropolitan Port-au-Prince, Haïti, 2010.



This paper by Anna Calogero, Paola Flores, Benjamin Biscan, and Silvere Jarrot of ESA Consultance in Haiti makes a valuable contribution to the second of these themes – AAP. By analysing the nature and quality of public participation in four urban planning projects following the earthquake of 2010, the paper demonstrates the benefits that may be accrued from participatory approaches, while also providing examples of the challenges associated with public participation. The paper contains valuable lessons for humanitarian and development organisations planning participatory approaches in the recovery phase of urban crises.

Published December 2017

This paper is part of a series of research pieces produced under the Urban Crises Learning Fund managed by the Institute for Environment and Development.

This research was funded by UK aid from the UK Government, however the views expressed do not necessarily reflect the views of the UK Government.

