

FGLG-South Africa

Progress report 2012



This research was part-funded by UK aid from the UK Government, however the views expressed do not necessarily reflect the views of the UK Government.

This document has been produced with the financial assistance of the European Union. The contents of this document are the sole responsibility of IIED and can under no circumstances be regarded as reflecting the position of the European Union.

**FOREST GOVERNANCE LEARNING GROUP – SOUTH AFRICA’S (FGLG-SA)
DRAFT 2012 TERM PROGRESS REPORT**

BY

FORESTRY SOUTH AFRICA (FGLG-SA CONVENOR)¹

FOR

INTERNATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR ENVIRONMENT AND DEVELOPMENT (IIED)

¹ Forestry South Africa (FSA), Box 1553, Rivonia, 2128, South Africa, Tel: 033 346 0344, Fax: 033 346 0399, Email: stevenng@idc.co.za

TABLE OF CONTENT

| | | |
|----|---|----|
| 1. | INTRODUCTION | 4 |
| 2. | APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY | 5 |
| 3. | FOREST RIGHTS AND SMALL FOREST ENTERPRISE | 6 |
| 4. | LEGITIMATE FOREST PRODUCTS | 9 |
| 5. | PRO-POOR CLIMATE MITIGATION AND ADAPTATION THROUGH FORESTRY | 10 |
| 6. | TRANSNATIONAL LEARNING AND PREPAREDNESS | 11 |
| 7. | INSTITUTIONAL CHANGES | 15 |
| 8. | CONCLUDING REMARKS | 15 |

LIST OF TABLES

| | | |
|-----------|--|----|
| Table 1. | An extract of the final draft FGLG-SA 2012 implementation plan | 4 |
| Table 2. | Learning events' framework schedule | 5 |
| Table 3. | Monitor implementation of IPAP3 | 6 |
| Table 4. | Monitor implementation of SMFE strategy | 7 |
| Table 5. | Monitor consolidation of stakeholders' inputs into land reform policy review process | 8 |
| Table 6. | Convene learning event on access to State and private sector production resource assets for NTFP based enterprises | 9 |
| Table 7. | Provide inputs into development of forest sector climate change response strategy | 10 |
| Table 8. | Provide inputs into SA's position on SADC FLEGT | 12 |
| Table 9. | Convene at least two FGLG-SA learning events | 13 |
| Table 10. | Benefit sharing business forest enterprise model(s) | 13 |
| Table 11. | Convene at least four SMFE related events | 14 |

1. INTRODUCTION

A number of practical activities within the FGLG framework were identified for implementation during 2012 operational year (see separate document) – although the sentiments from the Vietnam assessment were that it was ambitious. As ambitious as it was, the FGLG-SA gave it their best. Table 1 below is an extract for the 2012 implementation plan designed for the purposes of reporting on the main activities' milestones and overall progress.

Table 1. An extract of the final draft FGLG-SA 2012 implementation plan

| Activities | Anticipated impacts | Timing |
|---|--|---------|
| 1. Forest rights and small forest enterprise | | |
| 1.1 Monitor implementation of the National Industrial Policy Action Plan (IPAP) | Effective resource prioritization, allocation & utilisation by SMFE especially in community | 2012/13 |
| 1.2 Monitor implementation of the SMFE strategy | Development of support mechanism for SMFE; Effective resource prioritization, allocation & utilisation by SMFE especially in community | 2012/13 |
| 1.3 Monitor consolidation of stakeholders' inputs into land reform policy review process | Ensure that policy review process is sensitive to stakeholders' views | 2012/13 |
| 2. Legitimate Forest Products | | |
| 2.1 Convene learning event on access to State & private production resource assets for NTFP based enterprises | Promotion of forest access rights for NTFP based enterprises & opportunities | 2012/13 |
| 3. Pro-poor climate mitigation and adaptation through forestry | | |
| 3.1 Provide inputs into development of forest sector climate change response strategy | Ensure that strategy makes provision for real pro-poor benefits | 2012/13 |
| 4. Transnational learning and preparedness | | |
| 4.1 Provide inputs to SA's position on the Forest Law Enforcement, Governance & Trade (FLEGT) processes | Ensure that key forest governance issues are covered and discussed; Influence decisions on FLEGT thereof | 2012/13 |

| | | |
|---|---|---------|
| 4.2 Convene at least two FGLG-SA learning events on Outputs 2.1 & 4.4 | Create platform for the Group's contact dialogue; Workshop & generate Group's inputs on key issues; Group's visioning & capacity building | 2012/13 |
| 4.3 Benefit sharing business enterprise model(s) | Document and share lessons on benefit sharing business model(s) | 2012/13 |
| 4.4 Convene at least four SMFE related events | Create platforms to raise and/or discuss key relevant issues | 2012/13 |
| | | |

This report reflects on the abovementioned milestones' progress and/or outcomes, impacts, challenges and recommendations for the 2012 reporting period. In addition, generic governance developments with potential impact on the FGLG-SA activities are briefly reviewed for this reporting period.

2. APPROACH AND METHODOLOGY

As part of the preparatory work leading to the FGLG international event in Vietnam, March 2012, a draft 2012 implementation plan was developed, presented and discussed during the Vietnam event, and reviewed after the event and circulated to the FGLG-SA Members and IIED Team for further comments. A final draft plan was then produced based on the comments received and shared with the FGLG-SA and IIED, and became the organising framework for the Group's activities thereof.

Each activity and/or deliverable has its own customised methodology although a number of them may be similar. And for the purposes of delivering against the planned Group's learning events, the framework schedule outlined in Table 2 was drafted based on 2012 implementation plan.

Table 2. Learning events' framework schedule

| No. | Identified focal topics | Proposed dates | Nominated leaders | What was done? |
|-----|--|------------------------|----------------------------------|--|
| 1 | Access to non-timber forest products' production resources | July/August 2012 | An external expert was earmarked | An assessment of policy & various private sector operational contexts underway |
| 2 | Benefit sharing business enterprise model(s) | September/October 2012 | Mr Msa Madlala | A draft paper has been produced & event now schedule for April/May 2013 |
| 3 | Forest Law Enforcement, Governance and | October/November | Ms Pumeza | An extended stakeholders' learning event was |

| | | | | |
|---|---|---------------|-------------------|--|
| | Trade (FLEGT) process | 2012 | Nkwashu | convened (November 07, 2012) to consider a draft SADC FLEGT Programme |
| 4 | Convene at least four SMFE related events | May/June 2012 | Mr Steven Ngubane | Four SMFE type events on Emerging Timber Grower Codes of Good Practice (ETG CoGP) were convened – 1 in Limpopo, 1 in KZN & 2 in Eastern Cape Provinces |

3. FOREST RIGHTS AND SMALL FOREST ENTERPRISE

Three deliverables were identified and planned under the forest rights and small forest enterprise theme, viz. (1) monitor the implementation of the National Industrial Policy Action Plan (IPAP) 3, (2) monitor the implementation of the SMFE Strategy, and (3) monitor the consolidation of stakeholders' inputs into the land reform policy review process. Tables 3, 4 and 5 provide and reflect details on their outcomes.

Table 3. Monitor implementation of industrial policy action plan (IPAP) 3

| Objective | Methodology (tactics) | Outputs &/ outcomes | Impacts | Challenges | Recommendations |
|--|---|--|---|---|--|
| Effective Resource prioritization, allocation and utilization by SMFE, especially in communities | Nominate a Task Team for monitoring & reporting | A two membered Task Team (Mr Matome of Department of Trade & Industry as custodian of IPAP and Mr Ngubane of Forestry South Africa) was nominated. | Institutionalisation of a structured monitoring & evaluation mechanism | Slow uptake of the project development &/ packaging support by communities; Institutional conflicts in the ever changing organisational landscape; | Raise awareness of the support offerings with local government and traditional authorities – representation was made to both KZN & EC forestry development forums as coordinators in their jurisdiction. |
| | | Progress is on track with respect to the 27 license applications' EIA exercise in the EC supported during 2011 by DAFF & DTI. | Facilitation of the afforestation licensing process; Making planning resources available to support rural communities; | | |
| | | Excess of 22 new forestry development license applications (1, 265 HA) in KZN are being supported to undertake EIA by | | | |

| | | | | | |
|--|-------------------------------------|--|--|--|--|
| | | DTI. | | | |
| | | Excess of 47 new forestry development license applications in EC are being sized for complete planning support by IDC. | | | |
| | | Capital funding (undisclosed) for 2 community afforestation projects 1 in KZN and 1 in EC (totalling 1, 200 HA) approved by IDC. | Access to necessary capital funding; Creation of 60 sustainable jobs; | | |
| | Issue a media release &/ an article | It is the view and recommendation of the Task Team that the story isn't complete – at least a media release &/ an article should be considered once certain EIA activities are completed | | | Wait for EIA to be completed, and then, issue a statement. |

Table 4. Monitor implementation of the small and medium forest enterprise (SMFE) Strategy

| Objective | Methodology (tactics) | Outputs &/ outcomes | Impacts | Challenges | Recommendations |
|---|---|---|---|---|--|
| Development of support mechanisms for SMFE; Effective resource prioritization, allocation and utilization by SMFE | Nominate a Task Team for monitoring & reporting | A two membered Task Team (Mr Mathiane of Department of Agriculture, Forestry & Fisheries as custodian of the Strategy and Mr Ngubane of Forestry South Africa) was nominated. | Planning financial support from the Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (DAFF), and 70 projects are being supported | Administrative leadership necessary to facilitate implementation of the Strategy hasn't been forthcoming. | Influence through the FGLG-SA network need to be exacted in order to structure & implement a much needed SMFE support programme. |
| | | Progress is on track with respect to the 70 license applications' EIA exercise in the EC that commenced during 2011 by DAFF. | | | |

| | | | | | |
|--|-------------------------------------|--|--|--|--|
| | | The DAFF Minister announced after meeting with the National Forest Advisory Council (NFAC) that DAFF would consider establishing a forest enterprise development support programme | Political will & pressure for a structured support programme as envisaged by this Strategy & Forest Sector Charter | | |
| | Issue a media release &/ an article | A draft article is being developed in partnership with SA Forestry Magazine | | | |

Table 5. Monitor consolidation of stakeholders' inputs into land reform policy review process

| Objective | Methodology (tactics) | Outputs &/ outcomes | Impacts | Challenges | Recommendations |
|---|---|---|---|-----------------|--|
| Ensure that policy review process is sensitive to stakeholders' views | Nominate a Task Team for monitoring & reporting | A three membered team (Mr Michael Peter and Mr Steven Ngubane both of Forestry South Africa and Mr Matlhatsi Seloane from the Department of Rural Development and Land Reform - DRDLR) was nominated. | Institutionalisation of a structured monitoring & evaluation mechanism. | None identified | Should the process of policy review reach green paper stage within FGLG-SA tenure, consideration should be given to convene learning event(s) on green paper(s). |
| | | Six commissions, i.e. Land Rights Management Board ² , Land Management Commission ³ , Land Valuer-General, Three Tier Tenure System, Communal Land & Legislative Amendment, were established by the Minister of | Provision of leadership & coordination on respective areas of the review process – brought robustness & various perspectives into the review process. | | |

² Mr Steven Ngubane served, when he was with FSA and Mr Matlhatsi Seloane continues to serve on the Land Rights Management Board's Commission, and thus, had and has first-hand contact with the process, respectively.

³ Mr Michael Peter continues to serve on the Land Management Commission, and thus, also has first-hand contact with the process.

| | | | | | |
|--|-------------------------------------|---|---|--|--|
| | | DRDLR. | | | |
| | | Five policy proposals have been produced by the respective Commissions incl. land access by non-SA, establishment of land mgt commission, land ceilings, land tenure security & rural development policy framework. | Clear, balanced & well-structured rationale for respective proposed policies. | | |
| | | DRDLR called for expression of interest for feasibility assessment of proposed policies (The Sunday Times of January 20, 2013). | Enhance validity, practicality & quality of the proposed policies before engaging the public. | | |
| | Issue a media release &/ an article | Process not yet at the appropriate stage for an article. | | | |

4. LEGITIMATE FOREST PRODUCTS

Only one deliverable was identified on the legitimate forest products' theme, i.e. convene a learning event on access to State and private sector production resource assets for non-timber forest products (NTFP) based enterprises, and its progress is reported in Table 6.

Table 6. Convene learning event on access to State and private sector production resource assets for NTFP based enterprises

| Objective | Methodology (tactics) | Outputs &/ outcomes | Impacts | Challenges | Recommendations |
|----------------------------------|------------------------------------|--|---|------------------------------------|--|
| Promote forest access rights for | Analyse & draft key issues concept | While concept paper hasn't been drafted, an assessment of policy | Provide key issues' framework & operational | See institutional changes' section | Constitute a task team ⁴ , as a FGLG-SA |

⁴ Such a team could draw membership from government (all sphere), private (including Rance, Mondi, MTO, SAFCOL/KLF, PG, SAPPI & HM), NTFP enterprises and civil organisations.

| | | | | | |
|--|---|--|--|--|--|
| NTFP based enterprises & opportunities | paper | & various private operational contexts has been undertaken | options as potential case studies for concept paper | | sub-committee, to provide coordination on the matter |
| | Convene a Group's extended learning event | Yet to be undertaken | Afford members an opportunity to share their experiences & inputs in enriching concept paper | | |
| | Review the draft concept paper | Yet to be undertaken | | | |
| | Meet with DAFF to table & discuss Group's paper | Yet to be undertaken | Sound, stakeholders & pragmatic views on access options | | |
| | Issue a media &/ article & track reactions | Yet to be undertaken | Create awareness & pressure for actions | | |

5. PRO-POOR CLIMATE MITIGATION AND ADAPTATION THROUGH FORESTRY

Some progress on the implementation of the National Climate Change Response White Paper as published during 2011 has been noticed, and specifically, assuming respective sectors' response strategies. The Department of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries (DAFF) has also initiated its sector process although still at an infant stage (see Table 7).

Table 7. Provide inputs into development of forest sector climate change response strategy

| Objective | Methodology (tactics) | Outputs &/ outcomes | Impacts | Challenges | Recommendations |
|---|--|---|---|---|--|
| Ensure that strategy makes provisions for real pro-poor | Draw lessons from other countries' processes | A number of processes' references have been secured including Mozambique, Tanzania & Uganda | Bring-in international experiences into the Group's deliberations & process | Slow progress on the implementation of the National Climate Change Response | FGLG-SA planned learning event should consider concept & make as much inputs |

| | | | | | |
|----------|--|---|--|--------------|--|
| benefits | Analyse & draft key issues paper | DAFF has produced their internal concept paper (circulated to members) & invited inputs on an exclusive basis | Intended to bring sound basis & framework to inform response strategy development | White Paper. | as possible because this may be last opportunity for the Group in the context of IIED & FSA contractual elapse in July 2013. |
| | Convene a Group learning event | A learning event to deliberate on the concept paper is planned for April/May 2013 | Intended to enrich the paper by affording members an opportunity to share their experiences & inputs | | |
| | Draft a formal response on the concept paper | To be undertaken | Afford members an opportunity to share their experiences & inputs in enriching concept paper | | |
| | Meet with DAFF to table & discuss Group's response | To be undertaken | Sound, stakeholders & pragmatic views on access options | | |
| | Issue a media &/ article & track reactions | To be undertaken | | | |

6. TRANSNATIONAL LEARNING AND PREPAREDNESS

Four activities, i.e. provide inputs into SADC Forest Law Enforcement, Governance and Trade (FLEGT), convene at least two Group's learning event, draft benefit sharing business forest enterprise model(s) and convene at least four SMFE related events, are being reported on under this theme (see Table 8, 9, 10 & 11).

Table 8. Provide inputs into SA's position on SADC Forest Law Enforcement, Governance and Trade (FLEGT)

| Objective | Methodology (tactics) | Outputs &/ outcomes | Impacts | Challenges | Recommendations |
|---|---|--|--|-----------------|---|
| Ensure that key forest governance & trade issues are covered & influence SADC process thereof | FGLG-SA as SA stakeholders' group for purpose of consulting on SADC FLEGT Process | SZ Ngubane & M Kgowedi members of the SA's Representative Team ⁵ on SADC FLEGT Process | Member of the Working Group that produced the draft SADC FLEGT Programme (document available on request) that will be considered by SADC Technical Committee on February 20-21, 2013 | None identified | A follow-up event should be convened to deliberate on SA's action plan for implementation of the SADC FLEGT Programme |
| | | Participated on three SADC FLEGT Working Group meetings – May 14&15, July 30&31 and November 28&29 | | | |
| | | SZ Ngubane nominated as a member of the SADC Timber Association (SADC TA) Task Team ⁶ | SADC TA Team has produced a concept document (document available on request) & currently drafting a constitution for SADC TA | | |
| | | An extended stakeholders' learning event was convened to consider a draft SADC FLEGT Programme as inputs into the SADC FLEGT Programme Working Group's process | Inform SA's position on the SADC FLEGT Programme process | | |

⁵ SA's Representative is constituted by Ms Pumeza Nkwashu (DAFF), Ms Mmakwena Maleka (DAFF), Mr Matome Kgowedi (DTI & FGLG-SA) and Mr Steven Ngubane (FSA & FGLG-SA).

⁶ Task Team is constituted by Mr Paul Makolosi (Malawi), Mr Steven Ngubane (S. Africa), Mr Ben Sulus (Tanzania), Mr Solomon Gamedze (Swaziland), the late Mr Malcolm Smith (Zimbabwe) – may his soul rest in peace, Mr Jorge Chacate (Mozambique) and Ms Odillia Chilekwa (Zambia).

Table 9. Convene at least two FGLG-SA learning events

| Objective | Methodology (tactics) | Outputs &/ outcomes | Impacts | Challenges | Recommendations |
|---|--|---|--|--|---|
| Create platform for the Group's contact dialogue; Workshop & generate Group's inputs on key issues; Group's visioning and capacity building | Convene learning events on outputs 2.1 & 4.4; Workshop numerous key issues & make inputs; Reflect on & record progress & tactics | An assessment of policy & various private sector operational contexts underway on 2.1 output | Afford the Group & key stakeholders an opportunity to discuss, share experiences and inputs to respective decision-making processes. | Reliance on identified opportunities' champions to provide leadership – often than not things drag for no sound reasons. | Where possible, induce processes to facilitate actions. |
| | | A draft paper has been produced & event now schedule for April/May 2013 on 4.4 output | | | |
| | | An extended stakeholders' learning event was convened to consider a draft SADC FLEGT Programme as inputs into the SADC FLEGT Programme Working Group's process | | | |
| | | Four SMFE type events on Emerging Timber Grower Codes of Good Practice (ETG CoGP) were convened – 1 in Limpopo, 1 in KZN & 2 in Eastern Cape Provinces (see Table 11) | | | |

Table 10. Benefit sharing business forest enterprise model(s)

| Objective | Methodology (tactics) | Outputs &/ outcomes | Impacts | Challenges | Recommendations |
|-------------------------------------|--|--|---|---|--|
| Document & share lessons on benefit | Analysis of SA forest sector's operational options & produce a | A draft paper has been produced based on analysis of land restitution models, out-grower | Documentation of benefit sharing models' lessons into a unified reference | DAFF wanted to partner with FGLG-SA on this deliverable but | Incorporate the BBBEE Forest Charter Framework |

| | | | | | |
|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| sharing business forest enterprise model(s) | draft paper | programmes & privatisation model(s) – see separate document attached. | | kept on delaying, and eventually, FGLG-SA went on its own! | |
| | Convene a learning event to tease & discuss a draft paper & consolidate inputs | Draft has been circulated to Group members & learning event now planned for April/May 2013 | Intended to enrich paper by affording members an opportunity to share their experiences & inputs | | None |
| | Peer review and editing draft paper | Yet to be undertaken | Intended to enrich paper by bringing-in external experts' views into the drafting process | | Peer Review Team to be a combination of national & international experts |
| | Share final draft with FGLG participating countries | Yet to be undertaken | Intended to share SA's lessons with the rest of the FGLG members & influence their respective frame-of-reference | | Based on IIED's views, consider publishing the paper |

Table 11. Convene at least four SMFE related events

| Objective | Methodology (tactics) | Outputs &/ outcomes | Impacts | Challenges | Recommendations |
|--|---|--|--|--|---|
| Create platforms to raise and/or discuss key relevant issues | Identify opportunities & collaborate with other partners for implementation | Key SMFE stakeholders' engagement for the development of emerging timber grower codes of good practice (ETG CoGP) as part of the Forest Charter implementation (see separate document) | Afford key stakeholders an opportunity to discuss and inform development of ETG CoGP; To facilitate implementation of the Forest Charter; | Charter Council hasn't been visible since its development, and stakeholders naturally hijacked the process to raise and/or address broader Charter related issues as opposed to focussing on the | More consideration needs to be given to the implementation policies where they exist! |
| | Document outcomes and follow through | Four SMFE engagement events were convened – 1 in Limpopo, 1 | | | |

| | | | | | |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| | | in KwaZulu-Natal & 2 in Eastern Cape (see Task Team Report to the Charter Council) | | objective at hand, i.e. development of ETG CoGP. | |
|--|--|--|--|--|--|

7. INSTITUTIONAL CHANGES

During the reported period (2012 operational year), Steven Ngubane (FGLG-SA Convener) changed jobs by end of August 2012 and joined the Industrial Development Corporation (IDC), and this destabilised the FGLG-SA activities. There was uncertainty on FGLG-SA leadership until mid-November 2012, when Forestry South Africa decided to contract Steven Ngubane to see the Convener's role through the remaining contractual period (end July 2013). During this time no FGLG-SA activities ensued – which is partly why some planned 2012 activities couldn't be undertaken.

8. CONCLUDING REMARKS

The reorientation, i.e. FGLG-SA Team Member and/or an invitee subject expert to facilitate each learning event combined with other methods, of the approach as was also reported in 2010 term report has been working exceptionally well. It has encouraged Core Members to take ownership of activities and/or processes, which is important in order to achieve set objectives within anticipated timeframe.

There were, however, challenges during 2012 that impacted on the vibrancy of the FGLG-SA and its activities including the institutional changes (discussed above) and its impacts. To this end, FSA eventually devised a mechanism to retain the then convener to see the FSA and IIED contract through.

Generally, the Group has been poor in producing media releases and/or articles as anticipated in a number of deliverables. Expertise of professional journalist(s) are being engaged to assist the Group to address this matter, and the timing could be better, i.e. most processes are at opportune stages appropriate to entice public on identified areas.

The FGLG-SA's core members remain intact during 2012 operational period regardless of experienced challenges with the exception on Local Government and Department of Rural Development and Land Reform participation, and active members included:

- Mr Steven Ngubane (Convener);
- Mr Sipho Masuku (DAFF – KZN);
- Ms Nomalanga Mosala⁷ (independent SMFE);
- Mr Thulani Bhengu (independent SMFE);

⁷ Ms Nomalanga Mosala has been appointed as a Board member for the NCT Forestry Cooperative Group of enterprises including Bay Fibre, Shincell and NCT Durban Woodchipping – congratulations are in order.

- Mr Msa Madlala (independent SMFE);
- Mr Falakhe Malunga (forestry based community organisation);
- Mr Nkosiphindile Quvile⁸ (DAFF – EC);
- Mr Matome Kgowedi (DTI);
- Ms Tsholofelo Motaung (DTI);
- Mr Nkosinathi Matiwane (DEDT);
- Mr Motsamai Nkosi (DAFF);
- Mr Chris Nicholson (IDC);
- Mr Renny Madula (DAFF).

In addition to the core members, other invitees and administrator that have been very supportive included Ms Pumeza Nkwashu (DAFF) and Mr Nathi Ndlela (FSA), respectively – their patronage is greatly appreciated.

⁸ Mr Nkosiphindile Quvile was appointed as the Eastern Cape Regional Director by DAFF – congratulations are in order.