

FGLG-Tanzania

NARRATIVE REPORT 2011



TANZANIA
FOREST GOVERNANCE LEARNING GROUP
2011 REPORT

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Forest Governance Learning Group (FGLG) is an informal alliance of in-country groups and international partners currently active in seven African and three Asian countries. In Tanzania, the FGLG team works on: issues of governance emanating from the illegal timber trade campaign implemented by the Tanzania Forest Working Group (TFWG); and governance issues linked to REDD pilot projects which strongly affect rural livelihoods.. The illegal timber campaign is based on the governance shortfall study commissioned by the Tanzanian government, and tries to demonstrate how effective and equitable natural resource governance is absolutely critical to development and livelihoods in Tanzania. The REDD activities are initiatives undertaken by TFWG members piloting the implementation of REDD in Tanzania.

Activities for the year 2011 were developed through consultations with the Tanzania Forest Working Group (TFWG) . The two outputs that we focused on are: “Output 1: Forest rights and small forest enterprise: Identifiable contributions to improvements made in key decisions about forest rights, capabilities and enterprise that foster locally controlled forestry” (these contributions will primarily be responses to the Mama Misitu campaign; and, “Output 2 REDD: Identifiable contributions made to an effective and equitable national REDD+ approach and practical governance improvements that enable REDD+ to support PFM.” In each of the outputs, a report is presented based on the developed detailed activities that were to be implemented in the reporting period.

Most of the activities implemented within the two outputs are greatly dependent on what partners in the Tanzania Forest Working Group are doing. During the reporting period it was not possible to capture the lessons learnt from the pilot phase of Mama Misitu campaign because the pilot phase of the project came up to an end in mid 2010 and it was expected that an implementation phase was to start in January 2011. But this did not happen according to plan and the planned activities were not implemented as anticipated. What we had in mind was to go back to the communities and find out how they have been addressing the problems of corruption and explore with them on how to report them to higher authorities and document them using the campaign opportunities. This is an issue that will be addressed in year 2012. The MM project has now been approved and the project will start from February 2012. We will have a lot to share from this project in the coming year.

There are a number of NGOs piloting REDD projects in Tanzania, but there was no platform where they could shared their findings or concerns. Each of the pilot projects was implementing its activities in a different area although most of them are funded by the Norwegian Embassy. They had no funds and no mechanism to coordinate them and share their concerns. FGLG was able to fill this gap, and served as the platform where all REDD implementing projects gathered and shared what they have and develop common stands for advocacy. This platform was able to develop some position papers; to submit to the national REDD Task force; and to publicly advocate the position of NGOs on REDD at the UN climate change conference in Durban in December 2011. The platform also enabled the REDD projects to discuss their respective strengths and weaknesses and learn from each other.

THIS TWELVE MONTH REPORT THUS TRIES TO HIGHLIGHT THE OBJECTIVES IN RELATION TO THE OUTPUTS MENTIONED ABOVE. I DESCRIBES PROGRESS MADE AND DIFFICULTIES FACED DURING THE YEAR - AND ANALYSES POSSIBLE OUTCOMES.

1. INTRODUCTION

THE FOREST GOVERNANCE LEARNING GROUP (FGLG) IS AN INFORMAL ALLIANCE OF IN-COUNTRY GROUPS AND INTERNATIONAL PARTNERS CURRENTLY ACTIVE IN SEVEN AFRICAN AND THREE ASIAN COUNTRIES. IT IS FACILITATED INTERNATIONALLY BY THE INTERNATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR ENVIRONMENT AND DEVELOPMENT (IIED) AND IS CURRENTLY FINANCIALLY SUPPORTED BY THE EUROPEAN UNION AND THE UK DEPARTMENT FOR INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT (DFID). FGLG'S AIM IS TO CONNECT THOSE MARGINALIZED FROM FOREST GOVERNANCE TO THOSE CONTROLLING IT, AND TO HELP BOTH DO THINGS BETTER. SINCE 2003 THE FGLG HAS BEEN CARRYING OUT FOCUSED STUDIES, DEVELOPING TACTICS AND TOOLS, HOLDING LEARNING EVENTS, AND WORKING AS A GROUP TO EFFECT CHANGE. FGLG IS WORKING IN TEN COUNTRIES - CAMEROON, GHANA, INDIA, INDONESIA, MALAWI, MOZAMBIQUE, SOUTH AFRICA, TANZANIA, UGANDA AND VIETNAM.

THE TANZANIA FGLG TEAM IS CONVENED BY THE TANZANIA FOREST WORKING GROUP (TFWG) OF THE TANZANIA NATURAL RESOURCES FORUM (TNRF). THE ISSUES TACKLED BY FGLG HAVE EMERGED FROM THE ILLEGAL TIMBER TRADE CAMPAIGN IMPLEMENTED BY THE TFWG AND FROM REDD PILOT PROJECTS – BOTH SETS OF ISSUES ARE HIGHLY RELEVANT TO THE LIVELIHOODS OF THE RURAL COMMUNITY AND TO TIMBER HARVESTING. THE ILLEGAL TIMBER CAMPAIGN IS BASED ON A GOVERNANCE SHORTFALLS STUDY COMMISSIONED BY THE TANZANIAN GOVERNMENT AND TRIES TO DEMONSTRATE HOW EFFECTIVE AND EQUITABLE NATURAL RESOURCE GOVERNANCE IS ABSOLUTELY CRITICAL TO DEVELOPMENT AND LIVELIHOODS IN TANZANIA. MEANWHILE, THE REDD ACTIVITIES INVOLVE THE INITIATIVES UNDERTAKEN BY TFWG MEMBERS PILOTING THE IMPLEMENTATION OF REDD IN TANZANIA.

Therefore, the role of FGLG in Tanzania is to coordinate discussions and share them with other stakeholders such as development partners, the media and so forth, and to link these institutions with the government on the basis of relationships built by the team with, for example, the Forestry and Beekeeping Division. For FGLG Tanzania to be effective, it is extremely important for the future of Mama Misisitu (MM – the illegal timber campaign) and REDD pilot projects to draw evidence from community members in the villages that demonstrates governance related shortfalls to the public and donors. Thus we are planning documentaries, for example, that we will contract individuals to develop with our film crew and some key journalists.

GENERALLY, THE ACTIVITIES CARRIED OUT IN YEAR 2011 ARE ALIGNED TO THE 2010-2013 PERIOD WHICH WERE CLOSELY LINKED TO DEVELOPMENT WITH THE MAMA MISITU PROGRAMME AND THE REDD PILOT PROJECTS. THEY BOTH AIM AT INFLUENCING DECISION MAKING IN FOREST GOVERNANCE AND A CREDIBLE NATIONAL REDD APPROACH AND ALSO A PRACTICAL REDD SUPPORT FOR PFM. THE MAIN OBJECTIVE OF THIS PROJECT IS TO CONNECT THOSE MARGINALIZED FROM FOREST GOVERNANCE TO THOSE CONTROLLING IT, AND TO HELP BOTH DO THINGS BETTER. TWO SPECIFIC OBJECTIVES UNDER THIS PROJECT ARE;

- 1) FOREST RIGHTS AND SMALL FOREST ENTERPRISE IMPROVED; THROUGH IDENTIFIABLE CONTRIBUTIONS TO IMPROVEMENTS MADE IN KEY DECISIONS ABOUT FOREST RIGHTS, CAPABILITIES AND ENTERPRISE THAT FOSTER LOCALLY CONTROLLED FORESTRY (THESE CONTRIBUTIONS WILL PRIMARILY BE RESPONSES TO THE MAMA MISITU CAMPAIGN).*
- 2) REDD INITIATIVES; THROUGH IDENTIFIABLE CONTRIBUTIONS TO AN EFFECTIVE AND EQUITABLE NATIONAL REDD+ APPROACH AND PRACTICAL GOVERNANCE IMPROVEMENTS THAT ENABLE REDD+ TO SUPPORT PFM.*

The activities for objective one that were being undertaken included; to conduct a study on timber trade and cross-border 'leakage' in Tanzania and Mozambique, to undertake a study on the drivers and outcomes of the timber trade between East Africa and China and to document learning and disseminate within/from Mama Misitu campaign and priority issues as they emerge. For objective two, the activities were to track REDD initiatives (big REDD projects, small/alternative REDD pilots and voluntary carbon projects) and sharing pilot experiences with China, to produce reports/media inputs, policy briefs, presentations etc on emerging lessons related to REDD pilot projects and pulling in results from Mama Misitu campaign (implications for REDD of illegal timber trade, implications of cross border illegal trade and other 'leakage' for governance of national REDD versus regional approaches). This report therefore presents an overview of the achievements, challenges and outcomes for the twelve month's (January to December 2011) implementation of the project.

2. OBJECTIVES

Although the main overall objective is to connect those marginalized from forest governance to those controlling it and to help both do things better, the specific objectives and their related activities are;

- 2.1 Identifiable contributions to improvements made in key decisions about forest rights, capabilities and enterprise that foster locally controlled forestry (these contributions will primarily be responses to the Mama Misitu campaign).

Based on this objective the following activities were to be implemented;

- a. To conduct a study on timber trade and cross-border 'leakage' in Tanzania and Mozambique
 - b. To undertake a study on the drivers and outcomes of the timber trade between East Africa and China
 - c. To document learning and disseminate within/from Mama Misitu campaign and priority issues as they emerge
 - d. To visit the TRAFFIC timber trade study sites between Tanzania and Mozambique and learn from it
 - e. To hold a round table discussion between FGLG Tanzania, FGLG Mozambique and the Kenya/Tanzania cross border timber and forest products trade to learn from each other
- 2.2 REDD initiatives made conducive to Tanzanian environment

Based on this objective the following activities were to be implemented;

- a. To track REDD initiatives (big REDD projects, small/alternative REDD pilots and voluntary carbon projects) and sharing pilot experiences with China
- b. To produce reports/media inputs, policy briefs, presentations etc on emerging lessons related to REDD pilot projects
- c. To pull in results from Mama Misisu campaign (implications for REDD of illegal timber trade, cross border illegal trade and other 'leakage' for governance of national REDD versus regional approaches).

2.3 Development and resourcing of FGLG – Tanzania

Based on this objective the following activities were to be implemented;

- a. Finalizing membership recruitment
- b. Conduct a retreat for FGLG country teams members to finalize project activities for year 2011 and agreeing on other procedures
- c. Explore possibilities of resourcing FGLG for internally and external.
- d. Participate in neighboring meetings to share experiences (Mozambique, Tanzania, Malawi, Uganda, Kenya and DRC) – phase one will include Mozambique, DRC and Kenya and phase two will include Uganda, Malawi and any other who may be necessary

3. PROGRESS TOWARDS OUTPUTS

3.1 Implementation plan

This section outlines the progress per activity and the collaborating partners in the process. In some parts it will link to other reports that were written while implementing the activities.

3.1.1 To conduct a study on timber trade and cross-border 'leakage' in Tanzania and Mozambique.

This activity was to be implemented in close collaboration with TRAFFIC Tanzania. The implementation was late to start as funding and getting contacts between Tanzania and Mozambique was very slowly as procedures to lay down ground work – TRAFFIC being the lead organization. However TRAFFIC has started building relationships between Mozambique and Tanzanian governments and some field reconnaissance activities in the border points of Mozambique and Tanzania. During the reporting period a high level delegation including the Director of the Forest Department Mozambique (DNMF) visited the Director of Forestry and Beekeeping Tanzania (FBD) to discuss how they will collaborate on;

- The issues of regulating timber trade between the two countries and harmonizing licenses and law enforcement joint efforts
- Exchanging experience and expertise in sustainable forest management, community based forest management, concession management, fire management and REDD.
- Developing formal agreements to activate this collaboration
- Promoting a wider Regional Forest Director's forum to bring in links across EAC and SADC countries (specifically noted – Tanzania, Mozambique, Kenya, Malawi, DRC, Zambia)

From the FGLG-TZ group Simon Anstey WWF CEAI, Jumapili Chenga from TRAFFIC-TZ, Cassian Sianga of TNRF and Rito Mabunda from FGLG MZ were involved in this process.

Results of this work include:

- Identification of focal points and conclusion of draft MOU between DNMF and FBD on above SFM, CBFM, REDD, trade/law enforcement etc aspects

- Final revision and signing of MOU planned for mid April 2012 and associated with field visits to concessions in Mozambique and dialogue with Chinese government officials and timber companies
- A field mission was carried out for the DNTF delegation to visit PFM villages in Rufiji District, question-answer session direct between the delegation and village forest management committees, exposure through visiting checkpoints on the extent of illegal Mozambique timber moving within Tanzania and degree of fraudulent circulating Mozambican timber permits etc.
- At the COP 17 in Durban (Dec 2011) members of FGLG were engaged in supporting further dialogue between Tanzania forest agencies and CSOs and their counterparts in Mozambique with media material on these various events, specifically REDD dialogue and experience exchange being captured on TNRF, WWF and IIED websites
- Details and the participants for a specific initiative to take such REDD exchange-dialogue further were identified at COP 17, and after some delays this has culminated in agreed meeting hosted by MICOA (Ministry of Environment Mozambique) involving FGLG-TZ and MZ members in the first week of May 2012.

3.1.2 To undertake a study on the drivers and outcomes of the timber trade between East Africa and China.

FGLG Tanzania members, researchers in TRAFFIC, WWF and IUCN in Tanzania, and link with IIED's efforts to establish the FGLG China-Africa forest governance platform with IUCN, WWF and others were a key to the success of this work. A number of FGLG members (TRAFFIC and WWF CEA) attended an Africa-China NRM meeting (timber, minerals, oil etc) in Johannesburg in early March 2011 - where there were opportunities to discuss TZ/MZ illegal timber flows to China and drivers from China with Chinese entities. This included the options for exchange visits for state and private sector Chinese players to MZ and TZ in late 2011.. This China exchange took place from the MZ side and the delegation of DNTF briefed their counterparts in FBD and FGLG-TZ while in TZ on the exchange visit noted in 3.1.1

Efforts between IIED and various members of FGLG TZ on looking at better understanding evidence and perceptions on forest governance from the African side of the China-Africa relationship have been evolving with planned roll out for 2012. .

Apart from this, a new initiative between FGLG Tanzania through TNRF has emerged where a cross border timber and forest products study is on its way. Concentration is on piloting in three border posts (Namanga, Holili and Horohoro) where timber trade procedures and regulations are being checked if followed (one year project financed by FAO). This project is focusing on three Tanzania-Kenya border posts only. A Draft report is almost available and will be made public in 2012.

3.1.3 To document learning and disseminate within/from Mama Misitu campaign and priority issues as they emerge.

during the reporting period it was not possible to capture all the lessons learnt from the pilot phase of Mama Misitu campaign because the pilot phase of the project came up to an end in mid 2010 and it was expected that an implementation phase was to start in January 2011. We had a documentary of governance shortfalls made and the idea was to work with Mama

Misitu implementing partners to make another documentary during the continuation of the Mama Misitu Campaign. The documentary was needed to demonstrate the efforts being made by the communities in curbing corruption and demonstrating best ways of relaying messages to higher authorities related to illegal timber trade. But this did not happen as planned and the planned activities were not implemented as anticipated. It is hoped that the take off of this project will be in 2012 where we may draw lots of issues for future learning. The expectation to have done the same in the Kenya – Tanzania timber trade was also not possible due to the lack of evidence generated during that period.

Following the timber trade study being undertaken on the three border posts of Tanzania-Kenya, a visit was to take place to see how a similar study could be undertaken in the Tanzania-Mozambique border. The timber trade study between Tanzania-Mozambique is being undertaken by TRAFFIC and the idea was to see how the two can be harmonized especially using the experiences we had in the Kenya-Tanzania study and see how it can be used in the Mozambique-Tanzania sites. This was also supposed to be followed by a round table discussion between FGLG Tanzania, FGLG Mozambique and the Kenya-Tanzania cross border timber and forest products trade to learn from each other. This initiative was not possible as the Tanzania-Mozambique study was not yet in place. On the other hand a round table discussion between FGLG Tanzania and the Kenya-Tanzania cross border trade meeting was held. The discussions included senior forestry and TRA staff from Kenya and Tanzania and TRAFFIC. The meeting was preceded with a field trip and discussion of the research.

- 3.1.4 To track REDD initiatives (big REDD projects, small/alternative REDD pilots and voluntary carbon projects) and sharing pilot experiences with China.

Hosted two REDD pilot projects event. In the first meeting we discussed the Tanzanian REDD strategy and agreed to have a small team to finalize recommendations which were then presented to the National REDD Task Force. In the second meeting we prepared a position paper for REDD pilot projects for COP 17 in Durban.

One of the encouraging results of these briefs was that the FGLG convener/TFWG Coordinator appointed to be a part of the sub committees in the REDD Task Force responsible for looking at legal issues. One meeting was held late last year to orient members on their roles.

- 3.1.5 To produce reports/media inputs, policy briefs, presentations etc on emerging lessons related to REDD pilot projects.

A break-fast debate was held on 28th January 2011, to discuss what communities get from participating in REDD. The presenters were FGLG members (Charles Meshack from TFCG) and Professor Pius Yanda from REDD Task Force. The main concerns were related to tenure (who owns the forest should be the one who owns the credits) and decision making (who decides who gets what and how when it comes to benefit sharing etc.?).

There was a lot of coverage in the media of this in the following day (The Guardian and Mwananchi). (See Annex 1 to this report – a list of weblinks to media reports connected to FGLG work). We could not repeat such session during the reporting period because the bookings for the policy debates are very tight and we hope in the following year we will make bookings very early, if we find a good topic to talk about.

For REDD there are strong implications from the work of the Mama Misitu campaign – about the effect of the illegal timber trade and about cross border illegal trade and other

'leakage' for governance of national REDD versus regional approaches. The REDD pilot projects have not yet generated much thinking, information and response to this but through 2012 the FGLG team hopes to stimulate and report on this.

- 3.1.6 Development and resourcing of FGLG Tanzania. Issues here were to finalize membership recruitment, hold a retreat for FGLG Tanzania members to finalize activities for 2011 and agree on other procedures and to participate in meetings by civil society groups in neighboring countries to share experiences. The retreat was conducted as planned in March 2011. Subsequent discussions on the work plan and budget were held and it was agreed upon and presented to other authorities. A report is also available. Later in the year the following personnel confirmed to be permanent members of the team, Jasper Makala, Jumapili Chenga, Noah Mpunga, Paul Nyiti, Elinasi Monga and Simon Anstey. Cassian Sianga will continue to convene the team. This will be the core team for FGLG Tanzania but efforts will also be made to get more members especially from academia, private sector and government.

3.2 Finance and administration

A report on this will be available from the finance department.

4. CHALLENGES AND LESSONS LEARNT

MAMA MISITU PROJECT

INPUT FROM MAMA MISITU PROJECT WAS TO BE USED IN THE FGLG PROJECT. DUE TO THE LATE APPROVAL OF THIS PROJECT IT CREATED A LOT OF LIMITATIONS TO THE IMPLEMENTATION OF FGLG ACTIVITIES. BUT THERE WERE A LOT OF INITIATIONS TO MAKE THE MAMA MISITU PROJECT COME INTO REALITY. THESE INCLUDED THE FOLLOWING;

1. Hosted a TFWG meeting on the 19th January 2011 where seven partners participated (MDI, TRAFFIC, TFCG, MJUMITA, WCST, JET and Clinton Foundation). The main agenda was on the situation of developing MM document.
2. In April 6th 2011 Cassian had a meeting with Merja and Anne of MFAF and Simon Milledge from Norwegian Embassy to discuss issues that need to be incorporated into the MM document. Simon made a presentation of the meeting outcome to the following TFWG meeting.
3. In April 28th 2011 we had the TFWG meeting where Simon gave the feedback from the two embassies (Finland and Norway). Ten (TFCG, TRAFFIC, LEAT, JET, WCST, MPINGO, WWF Carbon Tanzania, IUCN and TNRF) organizations came to the meeting.
4. There were a lot of personal efforts made for visiting MM project implementing partners in their respective offices and discuss what is expected from them. This was done during the month of June 2011.

NATIONAL RELATIONSHIPS

1. Made a presentation on process of development of MM document to SWAp on the 21st January 2011 and on the 8th March 2011. In the presentation, we mentioned what we are doing with REDD pilot projects and they requested to get update on REDD pilot projects activities in the following meeting also.

2. Being in the Advisory board member for IUCN project, FARM Africa and TFCG/MJUMITA participated in one board meeting of IUCN and FARM Africa and two for TFCG/MJUMITA REDD project. A general observation from all these meetings is that there are a lot of cases/testimonies in the field which need to be documented for advocacy. It is clear that a lot of projects being implemented, lack the ability to develop good documentation from the community perspective. In 2012 we will explore possibilities of making use of appropriate tools to send messages to different audiences. At national level we may concentrate on short video documentaries and power point presentations and at community level we may concentrate on cartoons.
3. TNRF Senior Forest Program Officer (Cassian Sianga), was recently invited by the National REDD Task Force to serve on the Technical Working Group for policy options on REDD in Tanzania.
4. Participated in a one week workshop (Comprehensive Climate Change Planning in Windhoek, Namibia 9th to 15th October 2011) sponsored by the World Bank (WB) in collaboration with the DFID. The workshop involved experts from different countries for the purpose of experience sharing on how to address the effects of climate change issues especially in the development countries which are mostly vulnerable with the case study of Tanzania.

INTERNATIONAL RELATIONSHIPS

1. Cassian Sianga was invited to make a presentation on the perspectives of Civil Society involvement in monitoring and legality assurance systems to SADC countries. A presentation was based on Mama Misitu to the Forest Law Enforcement, Governance and Trade (FLEGT) of SADC which aims at reducing the consumption of illegally harvested timber in the EU and ultimately in other major timber consumer markets by promoting sustainable forest management (SFM) and good governance. In the meeting it was also concluded that TNRF is doing a good job as it is evidence based advocacy organization and can set good platforms for engagement at different levels (national to be more specific) and have created a lot of trust at all these levels.
2. Since FGLG coordinated the meetings of the REDD pilot projects, Cassian Sianga was invited to participate in a HIMA REDD project learning event held in Nepal organized by CARE. The objectives of Nepal learning tour were to build the capacity of HIMA REDD project staff and partners through sharing the experiences of Nepal and Zanzibar, including challenges and lessons learned among the implementers for ensuring sustainability of community forest resource use and implementation of REDD. The leaning tour was held from the 18th to 29th September 2011 and a summary report is available).

Annex 1. Media reports on issues related to the work of FGLG and its members in Tanzania

Conservation of forests: Incentives should trickle down...

<http://www.ippmedia.com/frontend/index.php?l=32946>

The Guardian 3rd Sep 2011

The main aim of the National REDD strategy is to provide wide opportunity ... Tanzania Natural Resource Forum (TNRF) came up with several...

Activists want change on carbon credit payments

www.dailynews.co.tz/home/?n=17340&cat=home

Daily News 16th Feb 2011

REDD is a United Nations initiative to stop wild chopping down of ... the draft strategy under Tanzania Natural Resource Forum also pointed out ...

Fresh look at forestry status

www.dailynews.co.tz/home/?n=16959

Daily News 4th Feb 2011

... its obligations - under the United Nations REDD initiative on reducing ... country,” a representative of the Tanzania Natural Resource Forum, ...

JK's nod sought in world heritage bid

<http://www.thecitizen.co.tz/news/-/10287-jks-nod-sought-in-world-heritage-bid>

Key players push for urgent forest conservation

<http://www.ippmedia.com/frontend/index.php?l=27451>

By Gerald Kitabu

The Guardian 27th March 2011

Illegal logging rages, blamed on corruption

Link - <http://www.ippmedia.com/frontend/index.php?l=30678>

Interview with Rahima Njaidi from MJUMITA - the Community Forest Network of Tanzania

Link - <http://climatecapacity.org/news/newsletter/55>

Govt urged to involve people in carbon trade

<http://www.ippmedia.com/frontend/index.php?l=29496>

New scheme arouses villagers

<http://www.ippmedia.com/frontend/index.php?l=29199>

Other documents you might need are be found here:

<http://www.tnrf.org/groups/projects/redd/resources?group=21123>